

Music

In English Cathedrals

A Report for the Association of English Cathedrals

Prepared under the Chairmanship of

The Very Reverend Michael Yorke, Dean of Lichfield

May 2001

Contents

	Preface	3
	Members of the Report Group	5
I	Introduction	6
II	The Cathedral Music Department	11
III	Children in Cathedral choirs	29
IV	Concluding overview	40
V	Recommendations	45
	<i>Appendices</i>	49
	1: Provision for music in English Cathedrals	50
	2: The Cathedral Director of Music: framework and checklist for drafting a job description, and terms and conditions of employment	55
	3: A note on appraisal	58
	4: Care and supervision of children	59
	5: Children, government and the law	62
	6: Housing for Cathedral musicians and singers – a note on taxation liability and related pension contributions	66
	7: A note on employment, fees and pensions	67
	8: Models of good practice – a preliminary list	68

Preface

This Report is about the provision of music in Cathedrals. It relates specifically to the 42 Anglican cathedrals on the English mainland that form the Association of English Cathedrals. However, its findings, observations and recommendations may be more widely applicable in all those institutions that sustain some form of choral provision with a Director of Music and with children who sing.

The Report follows on from the Cathedrals Music Conference held at Swanwick in June 1999. The outcomes of the conference were first considered by an enlarged Cathedral Music Working Party (a subcommittee of the Association of English Cathedrals). A special representative working group was then set up to undertake the Report. The group included two Deans, two Precentors, three Directors of Music, two Headteachers and two Cathedral Administrators, representing different types of Cathedral and different geographical and topographical locations. The Director General of the Royal School of Church Music has acted as secretary.

The Cathedral Music Conference raised a substantial number of issues of varying scale, in five principal areas relating to cathedral music: the Music Department and Director of Music, children, law, finance and liturgy. The group, guided by the executive of the Association of English Cathedrals, chose to focus on the first two areas, and to receive comments on the third. Finance, though key to every aspect of the discussion, has been left to the Association of English Cathedrals, and liturgy to the Cathedral Liturgy Group.

The Report group worked principally in two sub-groups, meeting for a day at Southwark Cathedral on five occasions, on one of which it was addressed by the Very Revd John Moses, Dean of St Paul's. Most of the work has been undertaken through papers prepared by individual members of the sub-groups, which have been circulated and then discussed. In preparing the Report we have had in mind the need for briefing and examples of good practice for those taking up office, for those sitting in Chapter, and for those engaged in management of the Cathedral. The Report itself comments on the present state of Cathedral music, on changes in progress and to come, on good practice, and on new opportunities, while practical information is contained in the appendices.

We are grateful to Southwark Cathedral for hospitality, to the Association of English Cathedrals, the Deans' and Precentors' Conference, and the Ouseley Trust for financial support, and to the Royal School of Church Music for administrative facilities and resources. The sense of common purpose, commitment, mutual respect and openness demonstrated by the Report group has been a model of the inter-professional collaboration which is a key to the successful operation of a Cathedral, and especially in relation to its musicians and singers. We are all aware of the importance of this unique heritage, of its comparative fragility, of its significance in the life of the Cathedral and in Western culture, and of its principal purpose in the offering to God of those creative gifts which are voiced in music. We are also aware that it is dependent on people – on skilled musicians asked to undertake a post with very broad parameters, on children growing in the Church, on adult singers often combining Cathedral duties with a full-time job, and on all Chapters, clergy and lay staff who have to guide and support the work of the Music Department and understand its very particular characteristics and needs. The circumstances, context and environment of Cathedral music have been subject to rapid change in the past thirty years, and especially at this current time, both within the Cathedral institution and in a wider social and cultural context. The worth and impact of the tradition go far beyond its cost and its immediate contribution to Cathedral worship. It is a tradition that has to be further enabled by good management and best practice to extend the mission of the Cathedral and of the Church to best effect.

This Report is not intended to provide a blueprint for all Cathedrals in the running of their music, but a spur to Chapters and Music Departments to reflect on their own ways and priorities, so that their decisions can allow music to flourish and develop most appropriately in their own setting. The Report also draws attention to important and timely opportunities for the Cathedrals to work together to raise the profile of Cathedral music nationally, and especially to address common concerns regarding recruitment and funding.

Where recommendations are made, and especially where processes that may have legal implications are commended, we make these in good faith, but emphasize that these are intended for guidance and are made without liability. Cathedrals should seek their own legal guidance wherever they believe it to be appropriate or necessary.

As Chairman, I thank all the members of the Report group for their commitment to the task. We have had to work hard and fast over a given, limited period, and this has made great demands on already full diaries. Attendance at sessions and faithfulness to deadlines have been remarkable. Special thanks are due to Canon Charles Stewart who chaired the sub-group dealing with children, to Professor John Harper who has done most of the preparation of papers, minutes, and the writing up of the Report, to Dr Megan O'Connor and Timothy Hone who have assisted in the writing up especially of section II, and to our consultants and advisers who have always been ready to assist us. We recognize that we have not been able in the time available to deal with everything we would have wished, but we hope that the Report will be helpful to thinking and contributory to fresh resolve and action.

Michael Yorke

Dean of Lichfield
Ascension Day, 2001

Members of the Report Group

The Very Revd Michael Yorke, Dean of Lichfield (formerly Provost of Portsmouth)
(chairman)

Mr Timothy Hone, Organist and Director of Music, Newcastle Cathedral

Mr Marcus Huxley, Organist and Master of the Choristers, Birmingham Cathedral

Mrs Sarah King, Administrator, Southwark Cathedral

The Very Revd John Methuen, Dean of Ripon

Mr Andrew Millington, Director of Music, Exeter Cathedral (formerly Organist of Guildford Cathedral)

The Revd Peter Moger, Vicar of Godmanchester (formerly Precentor of Ely Cathedral)

Brigadier Christopher Owen, Chapter Clerk, Salisbury Cathedral

The Revd Dr Brian Rees, Headmaster, The Pilgrims' School, Winchester

The Revd Canon Charles Stewart, Precentor, Winchester Cathedral

Mr Richard White, Headmaster, Polwhele House School, Truro, and Chairman of the Choir Schools' Association

Professor John Harper, Director General, Royal School of Church Music (secretary)

Dr Megan O'Connor (research and editorial assistant)

I: Introduction

This Report sets out to review two key aspects of music in English Cathedrals: the Cathedral Music Department, and the children who sing in Cathedral choirs. These aspects cannot be isolated from the wider issues of the Cathedral as institution, working organization, and praying community, and the new context effected by *The Cathedrals' Measure 1999*.

The Report is written in the knowledge that change is inevitable and already in progress. It is offered to the English Cathedrals to assist them in reflecting on their own current practices and provision for music, and in undertaking future planning and development. The Report is addressed to all engaged in shaping and overseeing the life and worship of the Cathedral, but takes particular account of those who may be new to Cathedral governance, and therefore less familiar with the workings of Cathedrals in relation to music.

The English Cathedrals continue a pattern of worship based on daily corporate prayer that dates back to their foundation. That pattern now exists within the much wider remit of each Cathedral's overall mission and ministry, which has already taken account of the new liturgical, social and cultural contexts of the present time. This broadening of activity and ministry is reflected in the lively programmes of events, the range of special services, and in the continuing increase in the numbers of worshippers choosing to attend Sunday services at the Cathedral.

Music is a major contributor to the present vitality of Cathedral life. Cathedral choirs are singing at higher standards than ever, and reaching a larger number of people than ever through special events, tours, recording and broadcasting. In 22 of the 42 Cathedrals the numbers of young singers, and the opportunities offered to them, have increased considerably through the inclusion of girls. The expansion of mission and evangelism of Cathedral music is visible and measurable.

It is within this positive framework that this Report is written.

1. Looking to the future

1.1. Recognizing commonality and distinctions among Cathedrals

From the outset both the common ground and the differences among Cathedrals have to be recognized. The common function as the seat of the Bishop and 'mother church' of the Diocese defines the Cathedral; the model of governance now adopted following the *Cathedrals' Measure 1999* emphasizes commonality of organization, management and challenge. Differences in funding form an obvious distinction among Cathedrals, but there are other significant factors (including geography, staffing and links with schools) which make any expectation of commonality of provision and practice unrealistic. Durham and Winchester probably have more in common with one another than with their nearer neighbours, Newcastle and Portsmouth. Newcastle and Portsmouth (among others) might have more in common not only between themselves but also with some of the 'greater parish churches' than with richly endowed, ancient Cathedrals.

Every Cathedral can readily identify its uniqueness, and it is important that every opportunity is taken to share the substantial common ground between Cathedrals, and to work collectively to best effect. This may best be done by working in consultation with other Cathedrals or greater parish churches which seem to be facing similar challenges. General principles and

priorities may purposefully be set; but each individual institution will have to work out what is practicable and what is sustainable in the working out of those principles and priorities. In relation to the Cathedral's music, for instance, the skills required of a Director of Music, the remuneration and duties of adult singers, and the timetable and pastoral care of the children may vary significantly from one Cathedral to another.

1.2. Common factors to affirm

There are, nevertheless, important common factors which deserve recognition and affirmation.

- The formal worship offered in the Cathedrals, and especially worship enriched by music, is of inestimable value in the liturgical, spiritual and pastoral life of the whole Church of England, and especially of the Diocese it serves. It needs to be sustained as a living tradition.
- English Cathedral music is unique in its very nature, in its contribution to Western culture, and in the educational opportunity and Christian experience it offers to children. It needs to be valued by the Cathedrals, by their Dioceses and local communities, by the whole Church, and to be acknowledged as a significant part of our cultural heritage by the nation and its government.
- The current vigour of Cathedral music conceals its vulnerability, as the tradition becomes increasingly susceptible to financial stricture and social change. It needs to be underpinned in the short term, and serious consideration has to be given to those ways in which its stability and vitality can be secured on a long-term basis.

1.3. Recommendations for the future

Collaboration between Cathedrals is highly desirable, especially with regard to issues of public relations, national recognition, public funding, recruitment and training. The impact of all the Cathedrals working together can be far greater than any individual institution. There is a case for a national campaign of awareness of the value of Cathedral music, complemented by relevant local initiatives.

Current provision and practice should aim for the highest standards, and medium and long-term development should be planned to be sustainable. It is therefore important to review the existing situation in each Cathedral, and to undertake regular appraisal. Almost certainly this will lead to better use of resources and a better working pattern.

Everyone can benefit from and act on good information and advice on good practice, especially in an increasingly litigious age. That needs to be compiled, regularly updated and communicated in an effective way to all the Cathedrals and disseminated throughout their communities.

Cathedrals may be grouped by region or location (e.g. metropolitan, small town, etc.), but in relation to music it may well be the arrangements for children and the level of funding which are more significant indicators for grouping. Provision, practice and future development are likely to differ between four principal groups of Cathedrals:

- those with formally associated schools and with substantial funding;
- those with formally associated schools, but less substantial funding;
- those without formal school associations, but with reasonable funding;
- those without formal school associations and with limited funding.

It is important that the Cathedrals in the first group are not regarded as the sole and ideal model on which other Cathedrals should base their own solutions. Although the provision and

practice in each group may be distinct, nevertheless there is an opportunity for sharing of good practice – especially among kindred groups of Cathedrals – compiling relevant common information, evaluating perceived needs, and identifying possible solutions and appropriate means of development.

It is our aim that this Report should help individual Cathedrals to address immediate concerns and ongoing issues relating to musical provision in their worship with greater effectiveness. But more is needed. The survival and healthy continuity of Cathedral music may depend on asking and addressing some almost unthinkable questions. This process may be uncomfortable or threatening. Creative solutions must be sought to challenging problems through collaboration and with trust.

We recommend that this Report should be the beginning of a larger and necessary process, which examines and evaluates the English Cathedral choir, and considers carefully what is required for choral music to be a creative part of the educational and missionary function and the spiritual life of the Cathedral and Diocese. A long-term, collective strategy is required, with constructive dialogue and active co-operation among and within Cathedrals – together with other cognate institutions with choirs, interested trusts and societies – and with funding bodies in the arts and education, including government.

2. The context of Cathedral music now

2.1. Underlying purpose and continuity

This Report is practical in its orientation, but we feel it is important to underline the liturgical, spiritual and theological purpose which underlies Cathedral worship and its music, and the public witness of prayer and praise offered daily. We commend the continuing emphasis on the recitation of the Office (not least the singing of Evensong), which has at its heart the recitation of the Psalms, texts in which music and poetry are inseparable. The music of a Cathedral can transcend the texts it articulates, encapsulating the wonder of God's gifts to humanity (Psalm 19), expressing the life-force of the Holy Spirit (Psalm 139), and embodying the offering of prayer rising like incense (Psalm 141). It can inspire and move both heart and mind, increasing our awareness of God. The very intangibility of music (both physically and intellectually) is an essential complement to the tangible nature of the Cathedral, filling the space fashioned with that most remarkable of creative phenomena – human singing. As the old antiphon reminds us:¹ the tabernacle of God (Jesus Christ incarnate) rests in the living temple of God (i.e. humanity), and choral music collectively expresses that human sanctity.

The Cathedral is the seat of the Bishop and mother church to the Diocese, and is the model and principal source of witness, evangelism, mission, prayer and worship in the locality. Stability and continuity are essential features of the Cathedral's life. All who work in a Cathedral are, in some sense, its guardians. In every Cathedral, those who hold office – be it as Dean or Precentor or Lay Clerk or Director of Music – inherit from the past; and with that inheritance comes the responsibility to hand on to their successors. That receiving and handing on is the essence of 'tradition' – a word whose roots imply forward movement. Tradition is not frozen or static, but living; and that vitality is dependent on constant review and renewal. Cathedrals and their traditions must live, alert to challenges and responsive to change from within as from without.

¹ *Ecce tabernaculum Dei*, antiphon at Lauds for the feast of the Dedication of a Church in the English Rite.

2.2. Current commitment, achievement and impending threats

The pattern, identity and purpose of a Cathedral community may become skewed by custom, obscured by the daily realities of function and operation in a complex institution, and tested by ever-increasing expectations and levels of activity. Nowhere is this more apparent than in the Cathedral's music. The circumstances, expectations, and attainments of Cathedral choirs and musicians have changed rapidly, especially in the last decade; so, too, have the problems and the threats – particularly those arising from cost and from recruitment. The commitment to a tradition of choral services sustained by children and adults is common to all English Cathedrals, although the circumstances, levels of funding, and provision in each Cathedral may be individual and distinct.

The vigour, high standards and broader outreach of Cathedral music have been acknowledged at the outset of this Report. On the other hand, there are major concerns relating to funding and recruitment. The costs of good musical provision are considerable, and the budget required has to be judged against many competing priorities. Every Cathedral has also to face up to the difficulties of attracting and retaining able adult singers, of recruiting children (especially boys), and of engaging the best young organists and choir trainers. These are serious challenges, which have to be addressed in relation to musical and social contexts that have changed significantly in recent years, and continue to change rapidly.

In approaching the challenges of funding and recruitment, we have to recognize that members of Cathedral choirs are asked or expected to work hours which, alongside full-time education or full-time work, may be regarded as 'unsocial' and in conflict with family life. In reality, we operate within a culture which promulgates the notion that unstructured leisure is the counterpart to structured work, and therefore that a structured commitment to sing in a Cathedral choir may appear to be additional 'work'. We have also to address assumptions of a different kind: that work for God is not really 'work' and that music itself is a form of 'play'. These kinds of premise can too often allow the Church to offer more modest remuneration than 'the world of work'.

2.3. A staged approach

In addressing these issues a staged approach may be best. Three stages can be identified:

- Short-term Review of current provision and practices.
 Enhancement of existing processes in the light of new pattern of Cathedral governance.
- Medium-term Underpinning of current provision within a sustainable model of resourcing and funding.
- Long-term Strategy for the imaginative and creative development of Cathedral music as part of the overall ministry and mission of the Cathedral within a sustainable model.

At each stage there will be significant benefit from collaboration and collective action by all the English Cathedrals, as well as a place for detailed local review and planning within each individual Cathedral.

II: The Cathedral Music Department

Introduction

This section of the Report deals with issues and challenges for Cathedral music in the context of the Cathedral as a whole. It considers the relationship of the Music Department with other departments and structures that make up the Cathedral as institution, and the management procedures that underpin them. It recognizes that, while the main structures can foster good working relationships, these same relationships must be built among people rather than departments.

With this in mind, we suggest principles of good practice to help Cathedrals meet their challenges: to be more effective in identifying and addressing their primary goals; to respond to change in a positive and considered way; and to harness the energies of their professional staff and volunteers in such a way that would result in a synergy, enabling task-based groups to achieve more as a team than could be met by individuals. We hope that clergy, lay professionals and volunteers in Cathedrals will work with an increasing sense of common purpose, recognizing the benefits of well-structured discussion and a wide ownership of final decisions.

One theme recurred frequently: the need for clarity in decision-making processes. Such processes need to be built on consultation, negotiation, understanding of the boundaries of responsibilities, and a clear definition of what is expected in the first place.

Facing a new situation

This Report is not concerned primarily with resourcing and funding, but these factors cannot be ignored, not least because Cathedrals – whatever their longevity – are vulnerable to the current demands made upon them, and the cost of meeting those demands. There is a continual tension between the desire to do more better, and the limitations of resources and funding. This all affects the music.

2.1. The Music Department and its funding

The core musical unit in English Cathedrals consists of a choir made up of children (choristers) and adult singers (lay clerks), directed by a professional musician (often still called Organist and Master of the Choristers, but increasingly identified as Director of Music), with one or more Assistants. In the last decade 22 of the 42 English Cathedrals have made significant changes. With the introduction of girl choristers there are now 64 separate groups of children singing in the 42 English Cathedrals. The average size of a ‘Cathedral Music Department’ is now 46 persons, of whom 32 are children, a significant increase over the last decade.

Statistics must be treated with caution; nevertheless, they underline the scale of the musical operation in Cathedrals, and the differences in spending on music. The total spent by English Cathedrals on their musical provision now exceeds £7 million per annum. In individual Cathedrals this sum varies from less than £50,000 per annum to well over £250,000. At its most extreme, the gap between the smallest spenders and the largest is more than ten-fold. Scale of funding is not a reliable indicator of security or vulnerability, but it may be argued

that only a very few Cathedrals are spending sufficient to sustain a choral foundation with adequate remuneration for its music staff and singers, a strong administrative infrastructure, and sufficiently generous scholarships for its children. Further details of the resources and funding of music in the English Cathedrals are included in Appendix 1, together with tables.

2.2. Sustaining Cathedral music

Discussion of funding begs questions about the whole provision and function of music in the Cathedral. These are addressed and answered by stages within the Report, and brought together in the Concluding Overview. Nevertheless, it is important here to examine the need for professional musicians and adequate funding.

At a practical level, employing musicians on a professional basis enables the Cathedral to have clear expectations of attendance, musical ability and commitment. Such resources make it possible to aspire to an offering of worship that is worthy of its purpose and setting, sustaining and developing a choral tradition that is the envy of the world. In this way the Cathedral makes a statement of witness about the part which music has to play, not only in worship, but as a creative gift which enhances our experience.

Professional resources should enable a flexible response to changing liturgical structures, making possible the performance of a wide repertoire of music within a limited rehearsal schedule. A particular kind of singer has emerged from this pattern, skilled in sight-reading and ensemble performance. In many cases, these skills have been developed from an early age by experience as a chorister.

The future of Cathedral music depends on maintaining a commitment to chorister training and education, and developing the resources necessary to employ skilled adult musicians as Directors of Music, organists and singers. An immediate and ongoing concern is the level of funding needed to sustain a choir of professional standard – the cornerstone of musical excellence in many Cathedrals.

The Cathedral as organization

3.1. The Cathedral as a managed organization

Cathedrals increasingly see themselves as complex institutions with a diversity of functions and focuses, and substantial financial responsibilities and liabilities. The awakening of a management culture, the review recorded in *Heritage and Renewal* and the consequent institutional reform required by the *Cathedrals' Measure 1999* have effected a move towards a more sharply defined organizational structure, with lines of reporting, teams and departments, and a new pattern of governance and scrutiny with far greater lay involvement.

3.2. Professionalism

These changes bring to the fore the contrast between the informal understanding of status, protocol and good personal relations on which Cathedrals formerly depended, and the new ethos of a well-run, accountable, efficient, managed organization. With this new ethos comes an expectation of professionalism, a constant theme in our discussions. Two kinds of professionalism can be discerned: first, a professionalism of administration, financial discipline, management and operation, applicable to every part of the organization; second, a professionalism based on skills, experience, knowledge and understanding within a specific area. These two kinds of professionalism should not separate ‘administrators’ from ‘ministers’ (including musicians); rather, the first category requires development and training throughout the organization, and the second requires inter-professional respect and understanding.

3.3. The Cathedral ‘Music Department’

Nowhere is this more clear than in the Music Department of the Cathedral – itself a recent term, interpreted differently from place to place, but normally including the Cathedral choir(s), the Director of Music, one or more Assistants and some form of administrative support, most often overseen as a whole by the Precentor. The new term ‘Music Department’ implies a coherent administrative unit within the structure of the Cathedral organization. It acknowledges that the work of the singers and musicians goes well beyond the functions of singing and playing at divine service.

Forty years ago the Cathedral Organist was usually the unseen accompanist who rehearsed the boy choristers and played voluntaries before and after the service. The Director of Music is now a head of department (or of sub-department) with substantial administrative responsibilities, and often the visible director of the choir in services. The functions, expectations, responsibilities and profile have changed significantly; so too have the relationships with the Cathedral clergy, and with the Cathedral administration.

3.4. ‘Professional clergy’ and other professionals

The focus of a Cathedral’s governance is the Chapter, a body traditionally consisting of the senior clergy of the Cathedral, but now including Lay Canons (a new development in most of the older foundations), with the Dean in the Chair.

Cathedral clergy increasingly have not only to take on their traditional pastoral, expository and liturgical roles, but also substantial managerial responsibility. They have to operate as ‘professional’ clergy alongside other professionals. This requires understanding and respect, on all sides, which can imply a professional equality. This blurring of status can sit uneasily with the structure and hierarchy of the Cathedral, where the colleague in worship may also be manager and employer in the organization.

3.5. Cathedral Administrators

The Cathedral’s Chief Administrator (the Chapter Clerk, Cathedral Administrator, or whatever local title) is normally an experienced professional manager. Such a person may have the responsibilities and powers equivalent to a chief executive, perhaps working alongside an executive chairman (the Dean) and through the governance of the Chapter.

However, the Chief Administrator also operates a parallel managerial and administrative operation with a developed infrastructure of accountability, budgetary controls and reporting through the departments.

The Director of Music (and other heads of departments) may be faced with answering to one member of the Chapter as head of a Cathedral department (or sub-department), and to the Chief Administrator as head of an administrative and financial unit or (sub-unit).

3.6. Understanding, partnership and communication

There is always some blurring of this neat outline. The Precentor, who is often a member of Chapter determining policy, may also be head of the department of liturgy (or music) where he or she is expected to implement that policy. Depending on local circumstances, the Precentor or Director of Music may be accountable as budget-holders, and will almost certainly need to work closely with the Chief Administrator. As with all other members of the Cathedral's governing body and staff, the Precentor and Director of Music will need to be clear about their respective roles, duties and particular areas of responsibility.

Some of the tensions that can arise within Cathedral establishments may spring from the differing priorities of clergy, musicians and administrators, and the fact that they do not always speak the same 'professional' language. As a starting point, it is vital to think clearly about the priorities that spring from the essential purpose of Cathedrals. The *Cathedrals' Measure 1999* makes it clear that this task lies with the Chapter.

The Chapter

4.1. The Chapter as governing body, employer and senior management group

The Chapter is responsible for the oversight and running of the Cathedral as a whole. As a body, it acts not only as policy-maker but as employer. Its members may have managerial oversight of a variety of Cathedral departments, as well as pastoral responsibilities for individuals within them. While a Cathedral is not simply a business, it is now routinely accepted that its many and various activities should be managed in a business-like way. In this respect, some members of the Chapter will have a senior management role. Although there is not one common model of management practice, there are many common concerns. Under the new arrangements, Cathedral Chapters can no longer act with complete independence in matters of finance or policy setting. They will receive advice from the Finance and Investment Advisory Committee, and they will be accountable to the Cathedral Council, to the College of Canons and to the Annual Meeting, where the views of the congregation may be expressed. The experience of those Cathedrals which already engaged in wider consultation before the *Cathedrals' Measure 1999* (for example St Albans and Coventry) suggests that considerable benefits can result from the recognition of the commitment and support of congregation members, by enabling constructive discussion and involving them in decision-making. However, there is a balance to be struck: multi-layered accountability and wide consultation can result in delay and burgeoning paperwork, neither of which is desirable.

All of this implies a fundamental shift in attitude concerning issues of hierarchy, and the evolution of new patterns and understanding over time. With the impact of the *Cathedrals' Measure 1999*, Chapters will find themselves in a transitional period, in which the implications of their new Constitution and Statutes affect their working practices. This will

lead to an exploration of a more collaborative style of working, which may be unfamiliar and even challenging to some.

The Dean has a key role in enabling this process. Roles and areas of responsibility need to be defined, for effective working throughout the Cathedral and to enable individuals to contribute most effectively. Clarity is important, but considerable consultation may be necessary before definitions are drawn too tightly. Managerial and administrative responsibilities will be shared across the Chapter in different ways, though much of this will be implemented by lay professionals. All of this requires a range of skills and attitudes that may not be fully developed in clergy new to Cathedral ministry, or to those who have grown accustomed to older, more autocratic models of management. It is clearly desirable for training in management, team-working, financial planning and effective administration to be given to all Chapter members as part of their induction. At this period of change, all existing Chapter members should also have an opportunity to reassess and develop their skills in these areas.

This, in turn, will enable Chapter members to see team-work with ordained and lay colleagues as an opportunity rather than a threat, and recognize the merits of sharing responsibility and ministry with others. As a basis for this there should be well-defined roles and areas of responsibility, reasonable expectations and trust, and a climate that enables open discussion and consultation. Processes of review, both of structure and of individual role, should be a regular feature of Chapter management.

A key element of the Chapter's overall responsibility for policy will be the determination of the role music will play in Cathedral's worship and activities. As in so many other areas, the Chapter starts not with a clean sheet, but with sets of existing patterns and of established groups of people. It is likely that there will be strong support for the idea that a basic duty is to pass on to future generations what has been inherited. Nevertheless, decisions of fundamental importance will have to be made if Cathedral music is to continue to be viable, and some change may be both desirable and necessary. The Chapter has the difficult task of balancing the competing demands of different areas of the life of the Cathedral. It is not only proposed innovations that may result in a radical reassessment of the *status quo*; financial necessity may well force a reassessment of priorities.

4.2. The Precentor

The Precentor oversees and administers the liturgy and music at the Cathedral. Since he or she is fundamental to the proper ordering of the worship (i.e. to the mission and ministry of the Cathedral) it follows that the Precentor should be a full member of the governing body (i.e. the Chapter). Most of our group would therefore regret that the Howe Report's clear recommendation – that the person responsible for liturgy should be a member of Chapter – did not survive to find a place in the *Cathedrals' Measure 1999*. Although most Precentors are Residentiary Canons and full members of Chapter, a number of Cathedrals still have a Minor Canon as Precentor.

In a few cases, the Dean doubles as Precentor. While it may simplify the structure (the group also recognizes that the arrangement can work well), such a pattern did not receive widespread support within the group as a model for good practice. Since the main task of the Dean is to oversee the Cathedral as whole in terms of policy and strategy, it was generally felt that to combine the two functions might lead either to a concentration of interests, or the neglect of some part of the duties. At the very least, it makes it even more imperative that the Dean and the Music Department enjoy good working relations.

Despite the clear structural role for the Precentor already outlined, informal comparison reveals considerable diversity among both the duties undertaken and the skills that are

brought to the post. No two Precentors have an identical job description; each post-holder has a different balance of liturgical and musical expertise and enthusiasm. In addition to liturgical and musical awareness, and strong pastoral concern, the role demands constant alertness to changing circumstances, clarity of vision, and the ability to take the long view.

While a Cathedral may hope for a Precentor who sings like an angel, balances liturgical expertise and musical training in equal measure, is a good communicator, is skilled in administration and management, and is able to retain a sense of humour and proportion at all times, it is unlikely that all will find candidates who can fulfil every expectation. Chapters will differ about the precise role they require the Precentor to fulfil, and will need to identify realistic priorities. Whatever they decide, it is essential that role be clearly defined, in relation both to Chapter and to the Music Department, in order to release the skills, energies and enthusiasms of the post-holder in this important appointment.

4.2.1. The Canon Precentor and Director of Music

In most places, the Precentor will have the key role of enabling effective two-way communication between the Chapter and the Music Department, and especially the Director of Music. An essential part of the job will be to create conditions whereby all members of the Music Department can contribute to the liturgical life of the Cathedral – in a way that coheres with the overall direction set by the Chapter. The Precentor must enable effective reciprocal communication between Chapter and musicians. This task demands integrity, good communication skills, and an ease with personal relationships.

Ideally, a Cathedral will appoint a Precentor who, if not a trained musician, can understand the needs of the musicians, relate to their concerns, and effect good communication. This is one of the most important working relationships within the Cathedral. A healthy relationship can help to produce acts of worship marked by creativity, integrity and depth. However, if the relationship is less than ideally secure, there can be unhappiness, tension and confusion of role on both sides, which may result in worship confined by the status quo, carried out with an increasing lack of commitment and joy. The Precentor and Director of Music have complementary roles, and the ideal relationship will reflect the skills, talents and enthusiasms which each brings to the task; such a relationship demands mutual respect, trust, clear communication and a willingness to work together towards a common goal.

The regular presence of the Precentor in Chapter ensures that issues concerned with the liturgy, and of the music within it, can always be represented; in particular, it ensures that the case for financial provision can be put as strongly as possible. However, even when relationships work well, it cannot be assumed that the Precentor speaks definitively on behalf of the musicians (any more than the Dean can speak for another member of Chapter). For this reason, we recommend, as a matter of good practice, that the Director of Music be involved in all processes, both formal discussions within Chapter and informal discussions elsewhere, which affect and concern the Music Department.

4.2.2. Minor Canon Precentor

Despite an underlying conviction that the Precentor should be a full member of Chapter, there was a feeling of regret, strongly expressed, that Minor Canonries have disappeared from all but a few Cathedrals. Such posts offer junior clergy with liturgical or musical skills (as well as pastoral ability) the opportunity to work in a Cathedral early in their ministry, thus providing an ideal basis of both expertise and experience should they return to Cathedral

ministry at a later date. Cathedrals may wish to review this for the long-term future of Cathedral ministry.

There is a real need to recruit effectively to the few remaining positions. Currently there is a shortage of appropriate candidates for appointment to Minor Canonries, which makes these junior appointments more difficult. Positive steps could be taken to promote Cathedral ministry to those in theological colleges and on ordination courses, and to establish a mechanism for Cathedrals to share knowledge among themselves of possible candidates. The experience of being a Minor Canon Precentor is not universally happy. Some feel insecure because of fixed-term contracts. More worrying is the consequence that they can feel peripheral, and even unimportant, because of the fact that they have the responsibility for production of the Cathedral's liturgy, without playing a full part in the decision-making process that shapes it. Since they have no vote they can only be as effective as their colleagues on Chapter allow them to be. Precentors who are Minor Canons may find it easier to establish a good working relationship with the musicians, since the relationship is not implicitly that of employer and employee.

4.2.3. Precentor: other responsibilities

While the main focus of activity should be within the Cathedral, the Precentor, in common with other members of the Cathedral staff, may have a range of other activities which can create some conflict of priorities and increase overall pressure of workload. Many Precentors serve on Diocesan Liturgical Committees (often as Chair), or they may act as a liturgical adviser to the Diocese, addressing parish needs which may differ greatly from those of the Cathedral. Balancing these demands and priorities should form part of the training and preparation both for new and existing Precentors. Chapters should remain aware of the demands of additional activities on the time and energy of the Precentor, and help to negotiate an appropriate balance of activity.

The Music Department

Liturgy has now become a normative term to describe all the facets of the worship of the Cathedral. This encompasses music in worship, and therefore the primary functions of the Cathedral's choir(s) and musicians. However, the activities of most Cathedral choirs and musicians extend beyond the Cathedral's worship and beyond the Cathedral itself. A number of structural options are in operation. The Chapter may have established (or wish to set up) a Department of Liturgy which encompasses music; it may treat Liturgy and Music as distinct Departments for operational purposes; or it may treat Music as a distinct sub-department within a larger structural division. Almost certainly the budget for the Music Department will represent the greater part of spending on worship in the Cathedral.

Whether or not the arrangements are formalized as a Liturgy and/or Music Department, the implicit structure of such a department lends itself to an examination of the roles played by key personnel involved in the choral worship of the Cathedral and in the wider musical life of the Cathedral choir(s).

The Music Department may be overseen by the Precentor, but its operational head will normally be the Director of Music. The Director of Music is therefore the focus of this section.

5.1. The Chapter, Cathedral Administrator and the Director of Music

5.1.1 Structural and professional relationships

The relationship between the Dean and Residentiary Canons and the Director of Music operates at several levels. As members of Chapter the senior Cathedral clergy are governing body, employer and senior managers to whom the Director of Music is responsible. They are also close professional colleagues of the Director of Music in the conduct of Cathedral worship and the fulfilment of its Christian mission. This duality must be recognized, and the patterns of consultation, negotiation and working together clearly understood.

Within the Music Department the Director of Music has responsibility for one of the largest and the most diverse departments in the Cathedral, involving a complex series of relationships with full-time and part-time employees, children, and the children's schoolteachers and parents. The Director of Music is also likely to be a budget holder. These factors not only impinge on the Chapter, but also on the Chief Administrator of the Cathedral. Here again it is vital that the working patterns and decision-making processes, which involve Chapter, Chief Administrator and Director of Music, are clear and understood.

Precise areas of demarcation may need to be reviewed periodically and particularly whenever there is a change of post-holder. Such a pragmatic and flexible approach may produce happier results than one which regards tasks and responsibilities as fixed, acting as a structural strait-jacket, which restrains current and future post-holders and makes re-negotiation of responsibilities difficult.

5.1.2. Policy, accountability and operation

As a senior member of the liturgy and music team, the Director of Music is responsible to Chapter for the implementation of policy. Ideally, such policy will be set after proper consultation and the kind of team-working which leads to wide ownership of agreed decisions. At the very least, the Director of Music needs to know who is responsible for the development of new proposals, and should expect to be consulted about the implications of them for members of the Music Department.

There should be clear procedures for the communication of Chapter decisions to those who will be affected by them. Responsibilities and management structures should be clearly defined so that the Director of Music knows exactly where boundaries are set. Long-term strategy should be discussed with the Director of Music regarding recruitment, finance and music policy. If this is in Chapter, the Director of Music should be present, and will ideally be party to any decisions made.

Directors of Music should take responsibility as budget-holders for an agreed part of the budget, and meet regularly with the Chief Administrator (or Bursar), and with the Precentor in cases where the music budget is held as a designated part of a global budget for liturgy and music. This extent of the responsibility should be clearly agreed and should be supported by appropriate training. This should include the principles on which budgets are set and the basic skills necessary to understand the management of accounts.

Access to the Precentor and/or the Dean should be easy and direct, and should be perceived and experienced as such (through the Director of Music) by all the professional musicians on staff.

If relationships (i.e. between musician and clergy) start to break down, the Director of Music should know where to get impartial advice or support. It may well be appropriate for a third party to mediate in such circumstances.

5.2. The Director of Music

While the sections above deal with the structures relating to the Cathedral's music and the relationships between Chapter and Director of Music, this section addresses the post of Director of Music in particular. It is essential that there are clear terms of reference for this post, and clarity about the relationship between the Chapter and the Music Department.

5.2.1 Qualities and appointment

In appointing all Cathedral personnel, whether ordained or lay, it is important to consider not only the essential skills, but also the personal qualities needed for a post that combines significant leadership and managerial responsibility, with the need to establish effective working relationships with a wide diversity of people. The Chapter needs to be able to discuss long-term strategy with the Director of Music; to be confident that agreed policies will be followed, and that negotiated boundaries of responsibility will be respected. In turn, musicians need to feel confident that they will be heard and supported by the Chapter, that appraisal and review will be carried out properly, and that contractual arrangements will be fairly negotiated. In short, the appointment needs to be made in a way which gives both sides confidence and leads to the development of growing trust and open communication.

5.2.2 Range of responsibilities and duties

Directors of Music play a highly responsible – and visible – role in the Cathedral. As heads of department, they are responsible to Chapter through the Precentor or the Dean, depending on local circumstances, for the provision of music in the Cathedral. They are expected to lead, manage, direct and train (as appropriate) a team normally consisting of choristers, adult singers, Organ Scholar and Assistant Organist. They will have to liaise with chorister parents and negotiate with the staff of schools from which the choristers are drawn, as well as be responsible for the welfare of children in their care. (These aspects are treated fully in the second section of the report.) They may also be expected to organize a range of activities (for example, concerts, tours and recordings), both within the Cathedral and beyond, which enhance the ministry and mission of the Cathedral and raise its profile. As lay professionals, they will work alongside clergy colleagues in helping Chapter to shape the musical and liturgical life of the Cathedral.

5.2.3 Background and status

Directors of Music often have a background of training similar to that of clergy – in kind if not in content. Typically, they will have a university degree, as well as professional diplomas. They may have experienced life in other Cathedrals as chorister, Organ Scholar, Assistant Organist or Director of Music. They may well have served their current Cathedral for longer than some, if not all, of the clergy team. They have a great deal of practical experience of

music in liturgy (often, though not invariably, supported by detailed knowledge and understanding of liturgy *per se*). Most are, at heart, committed to the overall purpose of the Cathedral, and are unlikely to have sought out a Cathedral post for the musical experience alone.

Although they are key creative members of the Cathedral team, Directors of Music appear below the Chapter in the scheme of things and can be excluded altogether in some matters of governance and decision-making. Indeed, with the expansion of Chapters to include Lay Canons, it is vital that Directors of Music should feel valued, and that their contributions are not overlooked or undermined. Cathedrals should develop ways of working which make full use of the wide-ranging wisdom and experience that Directors of Music offer (as with other lay professionals). When matters of music or liturgy are to be discussed and decided, the Director of Music must be able to contribute to the discussion. This may be achieved by his or her attendance in Chapter in a consultative role, or by setting up a separate group in which appropriate members of Chapter and the Director of Music, together with the Chief Administrator when necessary, discuss matters as equals before they are taken to Chapter for a decision.

5.2.4. Skills required, induction and ongoing training

Because of training that often focuses on developing their skills as organists, new Directors of Music may lack adequate preparation in some of the following areas: vocal technique, training and vocal health; choral direction at a high level, liturgical planning, teaching skills, administration, recruitment, team-building, communication, personal management and the management of people and change. It is not always easy to acquire these skills once in post. There are significant issues here for the training of Cathedral musicians in the long term. It is worth observing that although the present pattern has tended to assume that the Director of Music will be an organist, this may not be an essential skill. Future appointments might broaden the field by concentrating on choir-training and other necessary qualities, in Cathedrals where there are already sufficient organ players within the Music Department to cover regular demands and emergencies.

Directors of Music would benefit from both intensive induction and the opportunity for regular training and development – some of which might be provided by the Cathedral on an inter-professional and/or inter-departmental level, or by an outside body. Formal or informal schemes of mentoring should be considered. In common with all members of the Cathedral team, ordained and lay, they should receive formal appraisal on a regular basis. (Some consideration of appraisal appears as Appendix 3).

In general, Directors of Music would benefit from help – from both their employers and their professional organizations – in building more opportunities for personal and professional development into their careers. Since they are now often expected to be managers and budget-holders, it would benefit all concerned if they were offered training in how to fulfil these new functions. In any case, they should have access to adequate administrative support. In some places, where the administrative demands are great, Chapter may need to clarify whether the department can continue to be run by a manager-musician, in partnership with a manager-liturgist, or whether the musician and liturgist would benefit from the appointment of a dedicated manager-administrator, who would, in structural terms, run the department. In any case, it is important to affirm the primary role of the Director of Music in providing musical leadership and inspiration within the Cathedral community. A balance needs to be

struck so that the burden of administration does not stifle creativity and proper attention to musical matters.

In addition, where the Cathedral has more than one choir, the Director of Music should be encouraged to share leadership responsibility with other members of the music team. The Chapter has a responsibility to ensure that any significant change of responsibility is reflected in the written agreements of those concerned, that any increase in workload is properly remunerated and that there are proper mechanisms to ensure that wider responsibilities and demands do not prove unreasonable.

5.2.5. Support and career development

Cathedral musicians often follow this career as a vocation, and have a totality of commitment that goes well beyond the professional. The outcomes may be misleading. There is a perception that some Directors of Music are powerful figures, not least because of their considerable musical or personal charisma. At times, they may even seem to ignore the needs of the clergy and congregation or the demands of the liturgy, in the pursuit of fine music-making. As a result, musicians can gain the reputation for being difficult. However, many musicians project more self-assurance than they feel, and it should be remembered that much of their work is subject to public scrutiny on a daily basis. This is both a challenge and a pressure. Where the pressure outweighs the challenge, they may need support. For, if the music begins to lack confidence and direction, this can be immediately apparent, and the quality of worship may suffer.

Directors of Music may remain in the same post for several decades. Having developed the particular package of skills needed for Cathedral work, they are not always well placed to move or to make a change of career direction. This can mean there is a risk of stagnation, and low morale. Good working practices, combined with regular opportunities for negotiated review and appraisal, should help to address these issues by enabling ongoing personal development and ensuring professional effectiveness.

5.2.6. Additional and extramural responsibilities and work

The Director of Music may be regarded as a full-time employee but there is often an assumption that he or she will take on additional extramural responsibilities within the post or by association with it. These may, for example, include diocesan duties (parish music adviser or diocesan organ adviser) or direction of a Cathedral or local choral society.

Distinction should be made among activities: those which are a requirement of the post, those which are desirable in building up relations with the wider community, and those which are permitted as part of the wider musical and professional activity of the Director of Music.

Many Chapters also allow their Director of Music to supplement their income by undertaking additional teaching, examining or performing. In forming a view about the extent and balance of the Director of Music's Cathedral duties and other activities, a Chapter may need to take into account the issue of professional and financial parity. By comparison with those with similar qualifications employed in comparable posts of responsibility in secondary and higher education, Cathedral Directors of Music are not highly paid.

A Cathedral needs to draw up a brief of additional and extramural responsibilities and work that are included within the contract of employment. The extent of these requirements should take account of their impact on the primary duties of the Director of Music and ensure a manageable overall workload.

Customary associations of posts (e.g. choral society conductor) may best be re-negotiated either at a change of post-holder, or on a periodic basis. Appropriate fee levels for additional occasional duties with the Cathedral which are beyond normal duties should also be set and reviewed regularly, using national guidelines set by the ISM.

Arrangements for additional work outside the contract need to be established on appointment, and regularly reviewed, perhaps on an annual basis as part of the appraisal process.

Some Directors of Music are able composers, and may write music for the Cathedral choir(s) or for external use. Agreement about the status of such activity needs to be negotiated, and the copyright status of any works produced by the Director of Music for the Cathedral needs to be clarified. We would recommend that copyright should remain with the originator, unless the Cathedral negotiates additional payments for the transfer of the rights.

Fund-raising is in itself a profession, with its own set of skills. Directors of Music should not be expected to take on this additional role. However, there may be circumstances where the Director of Music, as a musician of standing in the community, is best placed to seek out support for the Cathedral's music. Such contacts can then be developed by the appointed fund-raising body.

The extramural activities of the Cathedral choir(s) also require consideration under this heading, both in their own right and in relation to the work of the Director of Music. These activities may include broadcasts, concerts, recording and tours. The Cathedral needs to be clear about the purpose of these activities. They may be highly significant in the wider mission of the Church as well as in public relations and recruitment. Their extent and limits, and their organization and management require consideration, as does their impact on core duties and the total workload. It is imperative that there is clarity over external contractual arrangements: with whom is any contract made, and who has power of contractual signature in the Cathedral? Arrangements and monitoring processes, similar to those recommended above for Directors of Music, need to be set up for extramural activities of the Cathedral choir(s). Further discussion of extramural activity follows in Section 7 below.

5.2.7 Contract, terms and conditions

The terms and conditions of employment of the Director of Music, as with all paid employees, should be clearly agreed and expressed in a written contract. In addition to all basic legal requirements, this should include agreement about:

- the circumstances in which outside work can be undertaken by the Director of Music;
- a schedule which clarifies categories of service that are regarded as part of the basic employment and those for which an extra payment is usually made, together with an indication about the mechanism for agreeing the scale of fees (we would recommend that this should not fall below the recommendations of scales agreed by such professional bodies as the ISM);
- an agreement about the financial and contractual arrangements for broadcasts, recordings, concerts and tours, together with a basis for negotiation in respect of circumstances not covered by the agreement;
- an agreement about the copyright status of any works produced by the Director of Music for the Cathedral.

Appendix 2 offers a list of items that ought at least to be considered in the writing up of a Director of Music's brief, including a check-list of terms and conditions.

5.3. The Director of Music's Assistant(s)

In most Cathedrals, it is the Director of Music's Assistant who generally plays the organ for services. In many places, it would be of benefit if this Assistant were regarded as a Director of Music in the making, though the contribution of experienced and long-standing musicians, who function more as equal colleagues than assistants, should not be under-valued. Assistant Director of Music might be a more appropriate title in many instances than Assistant Organist. Assistants should receive appropriate training (whether from within the Cathedral or external sources) and be given the opportunity to gain experience in choral direction, voice training, appropriate ways of teaching and managing child and adult singers, the liturgical planning of music, basic management, administrative and computing skills. It is essential that they are made aware of legislation and good practice in respect of dealing with children. These issues are dealt with in greater detail in the second section of the Report.

The Assistant frequently takes responsibility for a second or auxiliary choir, which in some cases will be the girls' choir, under the guidance of the Director of Music. However, it is important that the Assistant does not become overloaded, and that proper time for the preparation of organ accompaniments and voluntaries is preserved. Assistants should be given proper administrative resources to carry out, efficiently, any extra responsibilities in their care. Assistants are currently appointed on a part- or full-time basis, varying from Cathedral to Cathedral; in all cases there should be a realistic assessment of the workload, and a salary that reflects the hours to be worked, the skills required, the level of responsibility, and the experience of the post-holder. In all cases the basis of the employment should be expressed in a clear written contract.

In order to create a package of duties, it is tempting to identify other important challenges which might be addressed by the Cathedral Music Department: the issue of parish music is an obvious example. However, the implications of this need to be thought through, since any sort of outside consultancy of this kind is likely to be a source of conflict with Cathedral duties, particularly on Sunday. Similarly, salaried or free-lance teaching duties have typically been part of the way in which Assistants have supplemented modest Cathedral salaries, but this arrangement needs to be carefully monitored so that Cathedral duties do not suffer: there should be enough time and opportunity for the development of the person and the post. The financial package offered to an Assistant should properly reflect the duties and expectations of the Cathedral.

5.4. Organ Scholars

Organ Scholarships can provide valuable experience for young players, either before, during or after time at University or music college. It is important to try to recruit candidates who can fulfil the expectations. Failing this, it may be important to match the duties to the skills of the post-holder. There should be a clear negotiated statement of the expectations, and the Organ Scholar should receive appropriate training, supervision and review. An Organ Scholar should not be used as a cheap substitute for an Assistant, but in many cases it will be possible to create a package that both provides the young organist with invaluable experience, and eases the workload of the Music Department at the same time. However, the time required to be spent in training and supervision of an Organ Scholar must not be overlooked in trying to create such a balance.

5.5. Adult singers: the Lay Clerks

The present and future recruitment of suitably capable and experienced Lay Clerks is crucial to the continuity and development of the present pattern of Cathedral music. Cathedrals treat Lay Clerks in two ways: either as part-time employees, or as volunteers who may be offered reimbursement of expenses. There are some who operate both patterns by the use of supernumerary Lay Clerks or Choral Scholars alongside the employed Lay Clerks.

Lay Clerks should be responsible to the Director of Music. There should be an opportunity for their concerns to be raised at Chapter. In the first instance, this would normally be through the Director of Music, though the Precentor has a key role here in having an overview of all matters that concern the Lay Clerks. Lay Clerks need to be able to distinguish between the Director of Music as their immediate manager and musical director, and the Chapter as their employer. Both Director of Music and Chapter need to be clear about the processes for the appointment, management, appraisal, discipline and dismissal of Lay Clerks, and to ensure that the arrangements are supportive, and benefit all three parties.

Some underlying questions relating to Lay Clerks should be considered. This may help to clarify differences in perception that may exist between them, the Chapter, and other staff and volunteers. For example: To what extent are the Lay Clerks 'ministers'? How do they relate to other staff within the Cathedral community? How are the skills and commitment they bring to the Cathedral and its worship recognized and valued? To what extent are they involved in the decision-making process, and kept informed of developments, which may affect them significantly? The answers to such questions will vary from place to place with particular divergence between those Cathedrals whose Lay Clerks are essentially volunteers, and those whose Lay Clerks are employed on a part-time salary. Taking time to answer such questions could help to create a more positive view of the contribution that Lay Clerks make to the Cathedrals, as well as helping to avoid misunderstandings and frustration. Such fundamental principles should be made clear in job descriptions, letters of agreement or contracts, and all relevant policy documents.

It is desirable that Lay Clerks be given access to regular voice care and training, but where serious deterioration has set in, for whatever reason, generous notice of retirement should be given in conjunction with pastoral support. We would advise a retirement age of 60 years. Such matters should be clearly stated in the letter of agreement or contract, and review conducted regularly, perhaps every three years.

5.5.1. Lay Clerks as part-time employees

Thirty Cathedrals engage Lay Clerks on a part-time or sessional basis. The introduction of the National Minimum Wage, together with the increased vigilance of the Inland Revenue, has led to a greater formalizing of the arrangements in some Cathedrals, and this needs to be kept under review.

The problem of recruiting Lay Clerks as part-time employees becomes ever more challenging, especially in provincial Cathedrals. Remuneration is generally poor. Where a Lay Clerk sings seven services on six days this represents a commitment equivalent to about 25% of full-time work. The reported average remuneration of a little over £4,000 is not attractive (an average figure already distorted upwards by one Cathedral which pays a substantial sum), and leaves a very large sum to make up a living wage. The part-time nature of the job, together with the difficulty of finding other work whose hours are compatible with singing commitments, can be problematic. Traditional patterns of singing in the choir and teaching in the choir school have largely disappeared.

The provision of housing or a housing allowance may be a significant part of the package in places where housing is expensive. Those Cathedrals that offer accommodation to some but not all of their Lay Clerks should try to ensure that a reasonable housing allowance creates parity. By law Cathedrals must now offer pension arrangements to each employed Lay Clerk, even though they are part-time. This must relate to the total value of the salary and any benefits in kind. The Lay Clerk is not obliged to take up the offer.

It may be necessary to look for new ways in which appointments can be made financially realistic, even if this puts an additional burden on the music budget. Fewer, better paid singers may be one option. A number of Cathedrals have a larger number of singers only at weekends. Imaginative educational projects linked with singing in schools and the community may offer one way forward.

5.5.2. Lay Clerks as ‘volunteers’

In the eleven Cathedrals where the Lay Clerks are offered little more than expenses, finance is clearly not the key issue that attracts singers to the choir. Here the sense of satisfaction must result from other factors. People need a good reason to give up evenings and weekends! In this context, the task of recruiting – and retaining – volunteers requires different skills and tactics. In addition, the sometimes challenging task of helping singers to retire with dignity should not be overlooked. However, the lack of realistic remuneration may also result in some compromise in terms of standard, outlook or expectation. The existence of a voluntary group should not be taken for granted. The involvement of their families should be encouraged and pastoral care provided, as appropriate.

In those Cathedrals where the Lay Clerks are effectively volunteers, consideration needs to be given to their engagement as committed voluntary workers who have to abide by the Cathedral’s regulations and practices, perhaps through letters of appointment and agreement, and to the ways in which the value the Cathedral places on their contribution might be recognized and expressed.

5.6. Choral Scholars

Choral Scholarships can provide valuable experience for young singers, either before, during or after university or music college. Some very successful Cathedral choirs have as many as half their adult singers as Choral Scholars, and one Cathedral engages only Choral Scholars. Many of the considerations detailed for Organ Scholars above also apply to Choral Scholars. It is important to try to recruit candidates who can fulfil the expectations. Particular care needs to be taken with young and forming voices to ensure that they are not overstrained by the demands of daily singing. There should be a clear negotiated statement of the expectations, and the each Choral Scholar should receive appropriate training, supervision and review. A Choral Scholar should not be used as a cheap substitute for a Lay Clerk, but in many cases it will be possible to offer invaluable experience to a young singer, and to enhance the lower voices of the choir at the same time. However, the time required to be spent in training and supervision of Choral Scholars must not be overlooked within the overall workload of the Director of Music and the Assistant(s).

5.7. Choristers

Matters related to children who are choristers will be treated at length in the next section. However, choristers are a vital part of the team, and it is important to mention them here in order to ensure that they are not forgotten when looking at the whole department.

Administrative support and budgets

6.1. Administrative support

An efficient music and liturgy team must have access to administrative support sufficient to enable them to carry out their departmental responsibilities. The returns from Cathedrals suggest that administrative support currently attracts very modest funding, though in some cases the bald figures may disguise support from other budgets in the Cathedral.

The extent to which administrative work has grown is a common concern of both Precentors and Directors of Music. Within the global amounts spent on the provision of music, the proportion spent on administrative support is generally small. More than half of the Cathedrals have introduced a girls' choir, and most departments generally shoulder greater managerial and financial responsibilities than before; but in most cases there has not been a proportionate increase in the staffing levels of musicians and dedicated administrative support. Often, the Music Department cannot solve this problem internally; a strategic review of the resourcing requirements is necessary, together with funding implications.

6.2. Financial processes and budgets

At present, few Music Departments will have the flexibility to increase their own level of administrative support in response to the marked rise in musical activities and administrative demands. This may be due to lines of demarcation within the budgetary processes (e.g. it may not be possible to replace items of capital expenditure with a salary, or salaries for singers and administration may be within separate budgets), lack of budgetary responsibility at the appropriate level, or lack of processes to re-negotiate the financial bottom line to an extent which would enable funding to be identified. This suggests a more general need for transparency, better briefing on financial processes and requirements, and access to those who make decisions than is often currently common practice.

Within the Cathedral management system, all departments could benefit from a shared understanding of processes for:

- internal accounting;
- budget setting;
- at what point and how budgets are devolved;
- what elements (e.g. salaries) are excluded from devolved budgets;
- encouraging budget holders to feel responsible for their part of the whole;
- bidding processes within the global budget.

Financial policies and procedures should be fully understood by all budget holders, with mechanisms in place for their review. In essence, the global budget should enable the Cathedral to anticipate with some precision the future financial position as a basis on which to set priorities. This will enable resources to be channelled to meet goals and policies. Simple incremental budget-setting is too blunt a tool for this task. Issues of ownership and of

identification with projects need to be taken into account when the budget is set. Once the budget is agreed there must be clarity about authorization and accounting procedures, about virement within and across departmental budgets, and about the mechanisms for seeking finance for non-budgeted and emergency expenditure.

The choir as entity

Most of this section of the Report has concentrated on the structural relationships of individual post-holders. Many of the main issues can be analysed and addressed in this way. However, there remains an area of discussion that concerns the relationship of the choir as an entity, with other constituent parts of the Cathedral body, including those who worship in the Cathedral as part of the congregation.

7.1. Choral services and the congregation

The extent to which the worshipping community should help to define priorities for worship in a Cathedral, where each of the main Sunday services is likely to have its own core congregation, is less clear than in a parish church. In addition, Cathedrals now attract many visitors, whether as worshippers, pilgrims and tourists. The music will be a key factor in drawing many of them to the Cathedral, particularly for the Festivals and great acts of celebration and commemoration. There is a danger that some of these visitors turn into pressure groups, concerned more with the preservation of the heritage than the organic development of a living tradition of worship and mission. However, it is difficult to be certain what attracts people to worship in a particular place. Most Cathedrals will have a strong core congregation of those who show great commitment to the Cathedral, and who may contribute to the life of the place in many ways; other people will come and go more freely. Although it is likely that the weekly pattern will include more 'said' services than sung, for many it is the sung services which are the glory of Cathedral worship, and the most precious part of the received tradition. However, for others (perhaps members of the Chapter among them) the importance and style of the music raises questions which are not so easily answered. The part which music has to play in the worship of God and the nurture of the congregation deserves on-going reflection as part of the way in which the Cathedral community adapts to changing circumstances.

7.2. A policy for the Cathedral's choir and music

Decisions on specific issues must be made in the context of basic policy about the purpose of the choir. It is important that this process results in a policy which the Precentor and Director of Music can support. Without that, the process of getting wider agreement is likely to falter. If there is a professional choir, that policy will need to be embodied in job descriptions and contracts, and there will need to be clear negotiated agreement with the choir school. Where the choir is more dependent on voluntary affiliation, the policy must be made clear in recruitment literature and letters of agreement.

Any specific proposal, from whatever source, should be examined in relation to the fundamental policy, without preventing the positive consideration of new or unexpected opportunities. In order to ensure that the final decision receives as wide an 'ownership' as possible, further consultation may be required.

All this serves to assist the Chapter and the Music Department to work effectively within an understood and agreed framework of decision-making, and to avoid situations where the location of responsibility for decision-making is unclear, or where decisions are made on an arbitrary or *ad hoc* basis.

7.3. Extramural activities

We have already indicated that Cathedral choirs are becoming increasingly active in tours, broadcasts, recordings and concerts. This raises a concern about how outside activities can be balanced against the regular pattern of choral worship. The issues can become more complex if they are connected with outside funding from secular agencies, or the fund-raising activities of a choir support group. Similar questions need to be answered if there is a desire for the choir to be heard out in the Diocese as well as within the Cathedral. Even within the Cathedral, there are sometimes difficult choices to be made about circumstances in which it might be appropriate for the choir to sing at a special service or commemoration, perhaps for an outside body, even if this means that they are not available for Evensong.

In all situations, however, practical questions of organization, finance, provision of food and accommodation are crucial, and the views of those responsible for these aspects must be given particular attention. In most cases, the proposal should go ahead only if it is judged practical, and if there is sufficient positive support to ensure its likely success. Proper consideration should be given to the implications created by the absence of the choir from a regular function. From the outset, it needs to be quite clear where the contractual responsibility for any agreement for extramural activity lies (including broadcast services). Ultimately the Chapter holds this responsibility, though powers for making agreements may be delegated. Past difficulties in some institutions make it apparent that appropriate procedures need to be put in place and understood.

Cathedrals will have to begin the negotiation – between outside activities and the regular worship – at different points. This will depend on whether they have a ‘professional’ choir (consisting of choristers in a choir school and salaried Lay Clerks), or a group that depends to a greater extent on the good will of chorister parents and adult singers. However, in general terms, these issues illustrate how structures, policy and decision-making processes which have been outlined above may help to work through such matters.

Support structures

It is hoped that the kinds of structures outlined above would lead to good working relationships and mechanisms for effective day-to-day operation and for dealing with problems. Additionally, since the Church has a particular responsibility for the pastoral care of all its employees, Cathedrals may wish to create structures for pastoral support which give people ready access to someone with whom they are not in a hierarchical relationship.

An employee handbook, detailing all common concerns and procedures, could be invaluable, giving all staff and volunteers easy access to information about normative procedures, as well as about legal and financial issues.

As a group we support and would wish to see development of the work of the Precentors’ Conference, the Cathedral Organists’ Association and the Assistant Cathedral Organists’ Association in providing professional training and support for their particular groups.

Within Cathedrals, schemes of induction and training can go a long way toward helping people to take on new responsibilities and helping to affirm them in new tasks. The task and costs of such training should be shared across the Cathedrals, perhaps administered through the Association of English Cathedrals.

III: Children in Cathedral choirs

1. Introduction

All 42 English Cathedrals include children in their choirs. In all cases they are the sole provider of the 'top' line in their principal choir (or choirs); 40 Cathedrals sustain boys' choirs, 22 of these also have a girls' choir, and at two Cathedrals boys and girls are combined. No English Cathedral relies exclusively on girls. In all there are some 900 boys and 500 girls in Cathedral choirs.

This represents a rapid change in numbers in the last decade. The introduction of girls' choirs in Cathedrals has had a significant impact on the whole world of Cathedral music, not just in the 22 Cathedrals that have established a separate girls' choir. The number of children engaged in Cathedral music has increased by over 50%. The average size of a Cathedral Music Department has grown proportionately, and with it the administrative and pastoral workload. The process of introducing girls (or deciding not to) has raised broader questions regarding the role, requirements, recruitment and financial support of children who sing in Cathedrals.

1.1. The tradition and the unique opportunity

Children have had a distinct place in the life of English Cathedrals for over a thousand years. The Cathedral as a centre of education, mission and spiritual growth has always ministered to children within the immediate Cathedral community. Within the whole of the Church (Western and Eastern), the provision for children in the choirs of English Cathedrals is unique: it sustains an ancient practice which has endured radical change, and which is respected and valued throughout the world.

The decision by Chapters to continue to sustain, and in many cases further develop, the close involvement of children in Cathedrals and their music, implicit in the statistics quoted above, is a significant vote of confidence in the tradition. But this should not mask the fact that the context in which this is undertaken and achieved has changed dramatically in the last thirty years. At the very least, the current position requires assessment and review.

The uniqueness of a child's experience in a Cathedral choir depends on his or her place within a close-knit, highly trained and disciplined team of other children working in partnership with adults. Within such a group, children are capable of artistic, technical and personal attainments far beyond what one would expect for their age. Furthermore, traits they develop within the choir – such as the responsibility of working in a group – will benefit them in most careers and roles of adult life.

1.2. Investment and commitment from Cathedral Chapters

Cathedral Chapters invested in excess of £2M in scholarships and expenses for children in Cathedral choirs in 2000, of which some 90% was given to support the boys. While it may appear self-evident that it falls within the remit of the Cathedral to invest in a child who shows interest, aptitude and potential (which is the nature of all scholarships, bursaries and exhibitions), it may be that such expenditures need to be explained and even justified more fully to administrators, managers and lay members of the newly-constituted Cathedral Chapter and the Council to which they are accountable.

Just as there is no common pattern for an English Cathedral or its choral foundation, there is no common pattern for children in the choir. The individual nature of each Cathedral and its

choral provision results in many distinct profiles of relationships, duties and interactions in matters relating to the children, and also to their parents and families.

1.3. Equality of opportunity and benefit

We have also to recognize the precedence in Cathedrals given to boys over girls, and the exclusion of adult women from the principal Cathedral choir(s). With few exceptions the opportunities and financial benefits associated with choristerships for boys are significantly better, and more numerous, than for girls. In part this may be justified by historical custom, by reason of the larger workload undertaken by many of the boy trebles, by the existence (in some cases) of a Choir School, by the fact that boy trebles may become the adult singers of the future, and in recognition that in the current climate it is generally harder to recruit boys than girls. However, it is not a matter that we as a reporting group would wish to conceal. Each Cathedral will need to reflect on these fundamental issues in its own way.

2. The Cathedral's responsibility and ministry to children in the choir

While any review of the role of children in Cathedral choirs must acknowledge the distinctiveness of Cathedrals, what they share in common is a responsibility and ministry to the individual child. The child's experience of the Cathedral and its choir is paramount, both on its own merits, and in relation to the whole of his or her pattern of life and growth as a person.

2.1. The need and basis of review

Relationships between the child and the group, and between each body that has responsibility for the choristers (collectively and individually, directly and indirectly) are key issues. There is an immediate opportunity for Cathedrals to review the provisions for, support of, and demands on the children in their choirs. Priority must be given to the review of the care and development of children in relation both to existing legislation and to trends that may result in new legislation, not only with regard to their protection but also to what may be deemed to be a working situation. The experience of Cathedral choristers has to match appropriate expectations of their individual development: educationally, personally and spiritually. The care with which Cathedrals have introduced girl choristers may serve as a useful model for the review of the whole choral provision. Issues of cost, recruitment, function, care and supervision, repertoire and workload have been taken into account in establishing a sustainable pattern for the new girls' choirs. There have been miscalculations with regard to the workload of musicians who train boys and girls, and (in one case) to the costs. But in general, Cathedrals have proceeded with caution and common sense. Such an approach seems commendable, and applicable to a review of boy choristers.

3. The experience offered to a Cathedral chorister

Many former choristers, now adults, look back and acknowledge their time as a Cathedral chorister as one of the exceptional, formative and most important parts of their lives. The whole experience has not only affected their childhood but also contributed importantly and

uniquely to their development as a person. The rewards and benefits can be immense, and not always overt or evident at the time. The opportunity to be creative at such a high standard, working as an equal alongside other children and adults, is unique. A daily pattern of challenge and experience is the norm for a Cathedral choir, contrasting with the long periods of preparation and isolated peaks of performance which are more typical of choirs in a school environment. Speed of assimilation, consistency of daily expectation, and exposure to a wide range of music consistently develop skills and standards (both musical and transferable) which are offered nowhere else in such profusion or combination. There are developmental, cultural and (above all) spiritual aspects to the whole growing and learning experience. The choristers' experience in the Cathedral choir extends and complements their experience in school, where their role is very different, and at home. Large numbers of children demonstrate remarkable and innate musical ability, and achieve very high technical standards within the constraints of their young voices. Many respond positively to the formality, ritual and sense of occasion typical of Cathedral liturgy. A Cathedral choristership offers these distinctive opportunities and experiences. It is not exclusively a specialist training for children of particular outstanding musical gifts, but is attainable by most children with intelligence, aptitude and natural musicality, often with no special musical training or Christian experience.

The expectation of very high standards, and the lack of concession to their age – in choral rehearsals and services – are both the greatest strengths and potential weaknesses for children in Cathedral choirs. In particular, their wider musical education, vocal training and spiritual development need attention. In the last twenty years there has been increasing attention to general musical proficiency and to professional care of vocal development, both of which must be regarded as essential; but there may be scope for more attention to spiritual growth, given the chorister's exposure to scripture, liturgical texts and preaching. Pastoral care and liturgical education should be provided (sensitively) by Cathedral staff, to ensure that choristers understand what they are doing, and why.

For many children, the worth of being a Cathedral chorister rests on their sense of fulfilment and enjoyment of the experience, and its balance with the other parts of their lives. Most children respond to a full, active and structured life, but the overall demands on them must be carefully monitored to avoid the risks of stress and overload.

4. The status of chorister duties, additional commitments and paid work

In earlier times choristers shared in the life of the Cathedral. It was a single pattern that integrated musical and general education, Cathedral singing, and a corporate life overseen by the master of the choristers. Nowadays most children singing in Cathedrals are balancing school, Cathedral, family, and their own individual studies (especially musical instruments) and hobbies. It is a full life. Care and clarity are necessary in defining the boundary between work and leisure. This boundary can easily become blurred, and a Cathedral's demands on its choristers must be appropriate. Cathedrals must attend carefully to legislation relating to both children and human rights.

4.1. Regular Chorister duties

The service of choristers in Cathedral worship is not paid work. Such a programme of rehearsals belongs with other Out of School Learning, commended by the Department for Education and Employment (see Appendix 6, section 3). Of course, the child's commitment

to substantial hours outside full-time education has to be reviewed on an ongoing basis, and deemed by all involved to be sustainable. That Cathedrals continue to make payment (whether in the form of expenses, scholarship or bursary) to their choristers is because of a commitment to enable the child to develop in a unique musical and spiritual environment, and the conviction that the encounter with the sacred is special. In upholding their duty of Christian mission, Cathedrals will review the child's experience and commitment by their own values.

4.2. Additional commitments and paid work

The matter is less straightforward in relation to broadcasts, concerts and tours. These experiences are valued by the children themselves, and can be outstandingly memorable and formative. Where they are planned as part of the choir's ongoing work, and arranged by the choir or Cathedral with parental consent, there may be no difficulty, since they can be considered simply as extramural activities. However, where they are part of a commercial promotion, governed by contracts, fees and all the accompanying legislation, there can be little doubt that the children are in a working environment. Any Cathedral choir with a substantial commitment to such commercial activity will have to proceed with great caution, since the borderline between service in the Cathedral and paid work may easily be blurred. These matters are considered in greater detail in Appendix 5, sections 1, 2, 4, and 7.

5. The relationship of the choir to the child's education

All children in Cathedral choirs are engaged in full-time education. This is the most important single common factor in reviewing their Cathedral duties. The relationship between their Cathedral activities and their full-time education is the largest variable, according to each institution and its location. The relationship should be both balanced and integrated. In practice the demands of choir and school, and individual circumstances, make this balance harder to regulate and monitor.

5.1 The relationship of Cathedral and school(s)

Much depends on the relationship between Cathedral and school. At one extreme, the school may be an integral part of the Cathedral institution, not only owned and governed by the Cathedral but provided principally for the education of the choristers. At the other extreme, each child may come from any school within a catchment area that may extend to as much as 40 miles. In the former, the life and education of the chorister can be regulated and monitored as a whole. In the case of the latter, there may be no contact between the Cathedral and the schools; the Cathedral choir is educationally and operationally a self-contained, extramural activity for the child.

A further distinction ought to be made between choristers who board in a school during choir terms, and those who live at home, in so far as it affects the management of time, and the nature and quality of the contact between Cathedrals and families.

5.2. The current distribution of provision

It is easy to assume that the majority of Cathedral choristers attend a single school, linked with the Cathedral, and that a majority are boarders. That may have been the case in the past,

but the expansion of girls' choirs means that this is no longer true. Of the 40 boys' choirs over half (25) have designated links with a single school, of which 15 have boarding provision. The remaining 15 draw their children from the local community; some have closer links with specific schools than others. At only six Cathedrals is the girls' choir linked to a single school (five offer boarding); the members of the remaining 16 girls' choirs are drawn from the community. Of the two mixed choirs one is linked to a single school (where choristers are day pupils) and the other draws on the local community. About 60% of boy choristers and 20% of girls attend a single school while they sing in the Cathedral. One third of boy choristers and one fifth of girl choristers now have the opportunity to board. This represents a substantial shift in the balance between boarding and day choristers overall: there are boarding places available for about 400 of 1400 children in Cathedral choirs.

5.3. Schedules and demands

Cathedrals with boarding choristers can purposefully fill more of the time outside the classroom: the children do not use time to travel to and from either school or Cathedral, or to adjust daily to home life. Cathedrals with day choristers have to take into account the impact of such factors, as well as the needs of the whole family. (It is fair to assume, for instance, that the family car will not always be at the command of the chorister's schedule.) Cathedrals which draw their children from more than one school have additionally to allow for the differing demands placed on the children by those schools, and to take account of a child's need to prepare for secondary school (including competitive or public examinations) and to adapt to a new school. Assessments, examinations and projects can also cause stress at specific times of the year. These factors suggest that Cathedrals may need to take distinct approaches to the choir timetable, the commitments of their children, and the demands and extent of the musical repertoire. Guidelines over Cathedral commitments in relation to current legislation are considered further in Appendix 5, sections 4 and 5. Cathedrals have responded positively over the years to the increasing educational demands on children, to the expectations of (and stresses on) their families, and to the employment patterns of their adult lay singers. They have recognized that choral services form only a part of the whole liturgical life of the Cathedral: over the year and during any one week, the majority of the services in the Cathedral are said and not sung. This represents a significant change in pattern over the last 100 years: at the turn of the twentieth century Cathedral choirs sang at least twice daily with very little respite during the year. The singing year now extends from between 36 and 40 weeks of the year. Most Cathedral choirs sing between three and five choral services during the week, and either two or three services on Sundays – a total of between five and eight services in each week. For the most part the singing year and the school year coincide, though the singing year extends to Christmas and Easter which always fall outside normal school terms, often at times when families have an expectation of doing things together. Most Cathedrals recognize that children and their families need breaks at half term, as well as at least one clear day free of Cathedral duties each week.

6. One choir or several? – towards a sustainable pattern

The introduction of girls as Cathedral choristers has changed far more than might have been expected. Centrally it raises the questions of what is ‘the Cathedral choir’? Is there one choir with a female addendum? Or are there several choirs, and – if so – what is their relative status?

6.1. Opportunities for more flexible use of increased resources

Where girls and boys sing separately there may be a case for recognizing three distinct groups – boys, girls, adults – who may train and sing separately or in combination. The use of these three groups alone or in combination may allow for the provision of all the choral services without putting undue pressure on any single group. At its most logical, it would be possible, for example, to construct a pattern where services are sung by boys only, girls only, adults only, boys and adults, girls and adults, and even with all three groups together on occasion. (One day might also be set aside for a visiting parish, school or student choir.) Such an approach may be appropriate where there is pressure on children’s timetables and on the recruitment and remuneration of adults. Some Cathedrals are already moving in this direction informally. If difficulties in recruiting adults become more acute, Cathedrals may have to rely more on their children to sustain sung services: one ‘urban’ Cathedral has for many years only expected adults to attend at weekends.

There are advantages and disadvantages in treating each group as a distinct choir. It can help to remove questions of status and priority (particularly between the boys’ and the girls’ choirs); it allows for a series of distinct repertoires for each group individually and in combination, as well as a central core when all sing together; it allows for more flexible use of the whole resource, and for a more pliant timetabling of each group (so long as there is adequate provision for salaried music staff, and sessional specialists in vocal coaching etc.). On the other hand, the repertoire of each group may become relatively smaller, the rhythm of daily services may be lost, and rehearsal schedules and timetables may be more complicated. We have also recognized that the status of boys may need special attention, particularly where peer pressure may be a problem.

7. Potential and attainment

7.1. Expectations at audition and in the early stages

Cathedral Directors of Music who manage to attract children to audition have to identify aptitude and potential. They cannot expect a child to bring pre-requisites of experience or attainment – in either singing, musical knowledge or Christian formation. Yet, too often, once a child belongs to a choir, the expectations mount. Young children are expected to achieve high standards singing a demanding repertoire. At the same time, schools expect good results, and many parents seek the high achievement in everything their child does. The need to review the demands on a chorister within a challenging but sustainable whole is pressing: too often each party demands results. An individual or group must be charged with responsibility for looking at the overall balance of the demands made on children in the choir.

7.2. The need for collaborative monitoring

Where school and choir are linked, the head teacher (or an appropriate senior teacher), Director of Music and Precentor should meet regularly and formally to review the ongoing and any occasional demands on choristers as individuals and as a group. They must take into account the wide age range of the children and the different outside pressures that will be placed on them. Where there is no school link, a group of chorister parents may need to plan and review schedules with the Director of Music and Precentor. Offering a sustainable whole is inseparable from the business of recruiting: already, parents are demonstrating preferences for choirs which offer good education and holidays free of choir commitments, even if there is less kudos.

8. Recruitment

A core concern for Cathedrals is the recruitment of children as choristers.

8.1. Recognizing changed circumstances

Changes in society at large – such as the patterns of family life, increase in parental expectations, educational demands and burgeoning extramural opportunities – have all affected recruitment, as have other changes in a church or school context. There is the general fall in church attendance over the past thirty years, and the specific decline in parish choirs (traditionally a good training source for Cathedral choristers). The practice of singing among children has changed, particularly in primary schools, where the repertoire of songs is often focused on a narrow and low vocal range. In most cases these have made recruiting more difficult. Boarding can also act as a deterrent in those Cathedrals with a choir school.

8.2. Presenting the opportunities though good public relations

Cathedrals therefore need to promote choristerships actively, dispelling outdated misconceptions, and stating the positive benefits and opportunities – musical, social and spiritual – of the chorister experience. Cathedrals should undertake this promotion collaboratively. For too long Cathedrals have worked individually, and even competitively. The raising of the profile and awareness of the opportunities for children in Cathedrals is now pressing. This cause is already being pursued by the Choir Schools' Association (CSA). However, of 64 boys' and girls' choirs in Cathedrals, only 35 attend schools which are members of CSA. The AEC, perhaps working with non-Cathedral choral foundations and the CSA, is in a position to address this collectively.

A number of national, regional and local organizations promote music-making among children. Specifically, there are bodies committed to raise the profile of children's singing, especially the RSCM, the Voices Foundation, and the British Federation of Young Choirs. There may be scope for Cathedrals to enter into broader collaboration with these bodies, for promotion, and for building links and networks, perhaps making use of the Cathedral as a venue.

Some Cathedral choirs already offer open days for children to come and sing with the choristers, and at others choristers go out into schools to animate singing. This kind of

exchange may not lead directly to better recruitment, but it is important for building links and raising awareness of the Cathedral and the opportunities afforded to children.

Furthermore, a general increase in mobility allows Cathedrals with 'day' choristers to draw on a wider catchment area; in some cases this has enabled Cathedrals to respond to the increased preference for 'day' schools, and to move from boarding to day choristers, or else a mixture of the two.

Cathedral clergy and musicians should no longer assume that Christian families regard a choristership as a positive option for their children. It is clear that many Christian families prefer to worship together in the parish church of their choice, and that some reject the possibility of their children becoming Cathedral choristers on spiritual grounds. Nevertheless, statistics suggest that 10% of those attending church on Sunday worship at Cathedrals.

Increasingly Cathedrals may be able to engage the pseudo-parish community that supports them regularly in building a network of contacts with families who might bring their children to sing in the choir, and to increase the provision for young and growing families.

9. Care and supervision

The responsibility that a Cathedral bears towards each individual chorister encompasses three main areas:

- musical and vocal development,
- personal and spiritual development,
- pastoral care and supervision.

Where the children attend a single school this responsibility can more easily be shared with the school staff. Where the children attend several schools then parents may need to understand their part in sharing the responsibility. However, Cathedrals need to provide adequate supervision for the children at times designated for rehearsals and services.

9.1. Musical and vocal development

Musical and vocal development is the responsibility of the Director of Music. However, the Director of Music will almost certainly need support from others in ensuring that each child is building a foundation of musical understanding and is using the voice well. The engagement of a singing teacher or coach who understands and is skilled in the training of young voices must be regarded as essential, and that of a voice specialist or laryngologist may be advisable.

9.2. Personal and spiritual development

Personal and spiritual development must involve the Cathedral clergy, and must be given an appropriate allocation of time. The responsibility for oversight of this may lie with the Precentor, but may in some cases be appropriately delegated to a lay or ordained person who has the skills to engage with children in these matters. Many Cathedral choristers seem to drift through the liturgical and musical experience without any considered Christian formation. Apart from those Cathedrals which run children's groups, the chorister's only organized Christian formation may be a confirmation class. This is a lost opportunity, and it may account in part for the speed at which so many choristers fall away from the Church as

soon as they leave the Cathedral choir. Of course, this work needs to be done with sensitivity: there is a danger of overload, particularly where a number of people share the duty of care.

9.3. Pastoral care and supervision

Issues of Child Care and Protection have brought to a head matters relating to the care and supervision of the children while they are in the Cathedral. Each institution needs to consider both its regular provisions and an emergency safety net with respect to care and supervision of the children at the following times, bearing in mind (a) the children as a group, and (b) the individual child – especially when he or she may be the only child present:

- Arrival (and transit between school and Cathedral)
- When rehearsing
- When not rehearsing
- When dressing, visiting the lavatories etc.
- Departure
- When undertaking a special event at Cathedral (e.g. concert, recording)
- When undertaking a special event at another venue
- When on tour

There are guidelines issued by the Bishops that accord with the Children Act legislation, and each Diocese has developed its own policies and procedures. No Cathedral can ignore these requirements. There should be a clear policy and procedure for the Cathedral, which should be reviewed at least annually. All staff who encounter the children (including Organ Scholars and adult singers, and in some cases vergers and sidesmen) must sign the required declarations, and be fully vetted, as required by the Children Act. They will also require proper induction and training, and ongoing development in these critical areas. Within boarding schools the added provisions of the county social services' registration and inspection unit must also be addressed. Further points on the care and supervision of children are included in Appendix 4 and Appendix 5, section 6.

10. Chorister parents

The change in the balance of boarding and day choristers has increased the central role of parents. More demands are placed on them, and Cathedrals will have to make communication and contact with them a priority. Even where there is a boarding school, most Cathedral choristers are no longer handed over by parents at the beginning of term and collected at the end. Parents are frequently involved in ferrying children, often at inconvenient and busy times, and in waiting before, after and during rehearsals and services. There may be almost daily contact between parents and the Cathedral, and responsibility for this should be shared, and not rest only with the music staff.

10.1. The Cathedral and choir parents and families

Every Cathedral must take proper account of parents and families. Even before recruitment and selection it is important to develop a strategy for engaging with, involving and working with parents. At best choir parents (and whole families) can become core members of the Cathedral worshipping community, offering assistance to the Director of Music in matters of supervision, administration and pastoral care, and an effective force for fund-raising. The experience of the chorister may transform the whole family in their experience of and engagement with the Christian Church. At worst choir parents can be a diffuse and competitive group, over-ambitious for their children, and a negative pressure group. Good care and management of parents may well bring rich benefits to both the choir and the Cathedral community.

Cathedrals should also recognize that, since many of their choristers no longer come from 'church' families, the experience of Christian worship and life may be new not only to the choristers but also to their parents, brothers and sisters. Care should be taken to ensure that these 'unchurched' families are helped to find their way into the spiritual and social culture of Cathedrals without awkwardness.

10.2. Impact of choir demands on the whole family

Cathedrals have to be realistic in their demands, and have a good collective and individual approach to engaging with the parents of potential choristers. They have to be aware that parents seek the best for their child, and that there are limits to family tolerance. An active Parents' Association can provide positive opportunities for the energies of the whole group to be channelled towards common objectives that support the aims of the choir(s), and of the Cathedral as a whole. Chorister handbooks which set out clearly the expectations and routines, and which provide contact numbers and other helpful information, are invaluable.

11. Life after the Cathedral choir

11.1. The Cathedral's responsibility to leaving choristers

The age range for boys singing in Cathedral choirs is proscribed: few now sing beyond their fourteenth birthday, and many finish earlier. Steps should be taken by the Cathedral to help a boy chorister over this change of both voice and life-style. If they continue to live nearby, the Cathedral may be in a position to continue to minister to them, continue their Christian formation, and engage them in the life and work of the Church. Their continuing musical development may also be fostered by the Cathedral. Where the Cathedral has helped with school fees through scholarships, steps may be taken to ensure that a chorister's education is not disrupted on financial grounds. These issues, together with other pastoral and practical matters, need to be considered specifically with the chorister and his parents. They should not be left to chance. Those Cathedrals who rely on volunteers in the adult rows often find that there can be a natural continuity for some boys, with or without a period for the voice to settle, who become 'trainees' in the back row.

Age ranges for girls vary from Cathedral to Cathedral. Those who bid farewell to girl choristers at thirteen or fourteen may present them with an even larger trauma than the boys, bringing to an end their involvement with Cathedral music just at the point that their voices are beginning to strengthen and develop. Steps need to be taken to support the girls over this transition, and consideration given to how they might be engaged – perhaps in a Cathedral

youth or chamber choir – where they live locally. Other Cathedrals use older girls, singing with them up to university entrance. Such an arrangement may well coincide with their moving away to higher education, providing some with the opportunity to join one of the outstanding mixed university choirs.

Where Cathedrals are located in cities with universities or colleges of higher education, there is an opportunity for fruitful links to ensure the continuing engagement of young men and women in Cathedral life and music.

Although Cathedrals may feel they have sufficient demands in dealing with current choristers, their mission and pastoral care – and their investment in the ongoing life of the Cathedral – may require them to take a more proactive stance in relation to former choristers, especially where they live within reach of the Cathedral.

12. The future

It is self-evident that the future of Cathedrals (and of the Church) rests with the children. The Church's wider mission and evangelism to young people has a particular emphasis in relation to Cathedrals, and especially to their choristers.

Even as the concerns about recruitment and retention of choristers mount up, there is a reluctance to undertake root-and-branch review, for fear of arriving at too stark a conclusion. The considerable international success of mixed university choirs may be regarded by some as an unwelcome portent or opportunity. For some Cathedrals such a choir could be the model for the future. However, we must be clear that their success is built on the foundations of the Cathedral tradition, and in many instances on the continuity from Cathedral choristership to continuing musical training in adolescence. It is this linked cycle that deserves further attention. It is a cycle that needs to be broadened beyond the independent-school core that currently pertains.

Cathedrals are faced with the challenge of re-engaging with young singers after university, and of maintaining links with them as young parents. From that core they can reach out to make contact with a wider body whose experience of church and Cathedral music may be superficial, or non-existent. There is a need for a coherent strategy that goes beyond recruitment, opportunities and good practice. Such a strategy demands a holistic approach: to the child as chorister, to the family as part of the Cathedral community, and to the child as future adult singer and parent of choristers. In this the issues relating to girl choristers who cannot become lay clerks cannot be ignored. (Among those who minister in the Cathedral, whether lay or ordained, adult female singers are now the only excluded group.)

A collaborative strategy can ensure the continuing tradition of children as choristers in most Cathedrals. Some may well have to adopt very different approaches to provision and/or funding. Some may have to review the demands. Ultimately the success of the Cathedral in ministering to its choristers is not measured in numbers of records or tours made, concerts or services sung; rather it depends on the opportunity for their spiritual and personal growth, and their nurture as Christians who worship with music.

IV: Concluding overview

This section provides a short overview of the Cathedral Music Report, rather than a sequential summary. It also places more emphasis on long-term issues than on matters of communication, operation and management, which have received detailed consideration earlier.

1. Basic assumptions

The report is addressed to all those engaged in Cathedral ministry – a ministry which includes clergy and laity, employer, employee and volunteer, parent and child.

It assumes the importance and particularity of

- the ministry and mission of the Cathedral,
- the primary importance of worship in the life of the Cathedral,
- the special role of music in Cathedral worship,
- the commitment to high standards,
- the Christian formation of children through their singing in the Cathedral.

It recognizes that Cathedrals have enlarged their ministry and mission, and that that enlargement has often included music, particularly through the increase in activities outside daily services, and through the introduction of girl choristers in over half of the English Cathedrals in the past decade.

It recognizes that the resources and funding of Cathedrals are already stretched, and that music has to take its place among other priorities.

2. Addressing the current situation

Two conflicting realities of Cathedral music today have been apparent to us: Cathedral music has never been more vigorous, widely active, and of such generally high standard; yet it is vulnerable, perhaps as never before, to social change, problems of recruitment and pressures of funding.

The vigour and the high standards to some extent conceal serious concerns about communication, collaboration, consultation, governance, styles of management, processes of decision-making, responsibilities, working practices, care and supervision within Cathedrals. Much of this has been brought to a head in the implementation of *The Cathedrals' Measure 1999*, by changes in legislation, and by the new culture of accountability and protection of the individual.

Many of these concerns are short-term or transitional, and can be addressed internally by the formulation and adoption of good practice. It requires that the Cathedral *as organization* is clear about the bounds of responsibilities, the processes of consultation and decision-making, the normative pattern of working practices, and the provision of care and supervision. In the case of music, the nature and operation of the relationships between the Chapter, the Precentor, the Director of Music and the Chief Administrator are paramount. While good personal relations will normally compensate for any shortcomings, the running of the Cathedral and its music needs to be underpinned by internal processes and systems which will work effectively when it is necessary to fall back on professional and formal relations.

3. The future of Cathedral music

The long-term concerns are less dominant in the Report, but are every bit as important, and require careful and timely consideration. They focus primarily on recruitment and funding, but extend to pastoral liturgy and the special place of singing children in Cathedrals. There is no doubting the profound commitment of those engaged in Cathedral ministry (again using a very broad and inclusive definition), or the support of those who make up the growing number of regular worshippers at Cathedrals. Those who are vocal in these two constituencies tend towards poles:

- those who protect the *status quo* for fear of what might take its place,
- and those who foresee serious difficulties in the *status quo*, especially with regard to funding and recruitment, and regard this threat as an opportunity to review and revalue the place of music in Cathedral worship and mission.

Put bluntly, each Cathedral has to reconcile

- what it wants to do,
- who it can attract to do it,
- what it can afford (and how to raise any new funds),
- and to consider how this might affect what it already does.

Such a review is appropriate to the Cathedral's music, and may be extended to other areas of its ministry and mission. It does not preclude the possibility that a Cathedral may decide to continue with persistence and renewed commitment to do what it has always done in the way that it has always done it; nor does it assume either contraction or expansion. It does offer an opportunity to take account of recent growth in personnel and range of activity.

In evaluating the place and future of music in a Cathedral there are three principal issues to address:

- the place, nature and extent of music in Cathedral worship,
- the educational, musical and spiritual purpose and pattern of the choir,
- the opportunities for the wider mission and evangelism of the Cathedral through music and musicians.

Cathedral worship broadly consists of three kinds of service:

- regular prayer among the Cathedral ministers, predominantly on weekdays,
- celebration by the Cathedral ministers with the Cathedral congregation, particularly on Sundays and Festivals,
- celebration by large groups assembling especially at the Cathedral, whether from the Diocese or from particular organizations or for special purposes.

The musical needs and opportunities in these three kinds of service are different, and the function, repertoire and even location of designated players and singers may vary in each. Not all services require music, even if there were resources to provide it, and not all require the same musical resources.

A review of musical resources need not challenge the tradition of the Cathedral choir. Rather it serves to show the flexibility of the Cathedral choir in providing for different

circumstances, and to suggest that there could be yet other ways of presenting and providing for music in some Cathedral worship, including the use of the Cantor, as is the case in other countries and other denominations.

However, it also highlights the fact that the Cathedral choir is far more than a music provider for Cathedral worship. It is not only part of the Cathedral's ministerial team, it is also a community in its own right with specific educational, musical and spiritual purposes, particularly with regard to children. It has the potential to undertake a distinctive mission within the Cathedral, in the Diocese, and in the wider world. There is already some exploration of this wider mission, but evidence suggests that the potential has not been sufficiently evaluated or thought through. Nor has it yet been reconciled with the expectation of daily choral services or with resource and funding implications. These challenges need to be addressed with imagination and creativity in planning for the future.

4. Resources, funding, recruitment and public relations

What can be achieved is largely dependent on people to achieve it, supported by adequate resources. Collectively the 42 English Cathedrals currently spend about £7 million per annum on the provision of music. Precise figures still need to be obtained, but reliable indicators establish that of this sum about a third supports children, a quarter goes to remunerate adult singers, a quarter provides the salaries of Directors of Music and their Assistants, and an eighth is spent on administration and other costs. In practice the distribution varies from Cathedral to Cathedral, and there is a twenty-fold variance in funding levels between the highest (around £0.5 million) and lowest spenders (£50,000 or less).

In matching spending to resource, a Cathedral must consider how to attract the best and most appropriate musicians and singers, especially the Director of Music, to fulfil its ministry and mission,. Each Cathedral may seek a different balance of skills, personal qualities and requirements. A vibrant animateur of volunteers may suit one position as Director of Music, but may not necessarily be appropriate in another.

All who work in Cathedral ministry have chosen to do so, and often with profound vocational commitment. In order to flourish that commitment needs to be complemented by

- opportunity to develop imaginatively and creatively,
- a manageable workload,
- personal financial stability.

The opportunities, demands and remuneration in Cathedral music often compare unfavourably with equivalent posts in education or freelance music-making, especially for young musicians and singers.

There is a major public relations challenge for Cathedrals to reach both Church and non-Church attenders to let them know that Cathedral music is vibrant and vigorous, that it is neither stagnant nor narrow nor second-rate, and that there are exciting opportunities for music and ministry. Cathedrals need urgently to respond to that challenge, and will do so most effectively if they work collaboratively.

Cathedrals have for some years failed to communicate the opportunities offered by the choir to children and parents, and applications are often very small. Even when most Cathedrals and schools have well-presented and informative websites, it is hard to discern from either what is on offer. Collectively the Cathedrals have no means of publishing their choristerships or promoting the exceptional experience offered to children and the material benefits offered to parents. Given the extent of their commitment and investment this seems extraordinary, and needs to be addressed with urgency.

5. Children in Cathedral choirs

The distinctive musical quality of English Cathedral choirs derives from their dependence on a top line sung by children. But the place of singing children in English Cathedrals and their ministry is rooted more deeply than in musical tradition or a special quality of sound. It is part of the essential ministry of the Cathedral that enables children themselves to take a ministerial part in the worship of the Cathedral. Their personal, musical and spiritual development is shaped by experience and participation within a collaborative group working in an adult manner to high standards, rather than by conventional learning processes. Countless choristers look back with wonder and gratitude, realizing what an exceptional opportunity it was and how it has been a crucial part of their growth.

The issues of Child Protection have raised awareness of the care and supervision of the children at every level. There is room for improvement. Parents, Headteachers, Directors of Music and the Cathedral Chapter are all, in some sense, responsible for the children in the Cathedral's choir: together, they should work to achieve integration and balance of the total experience and demands made of the child who is a chorister, even in those places where there is a choir school. Far more regular collaboration and collective review are needed, and those who teach and work with choristers need to understand and take account of the sum total of their commitments. In the Cathedral, too often the chorister's musical training is supported by minimal Christian spiritual formation, nor is this followed through when the child leaves the choir. An obvious opportunity for ongoing engagement and nurturing is missed.

Given the spectacular rise of mixed choirs in some university chapels, and of outstanding small professional ensembles, both of which have demonstrated internationally their accomplishment in the English Cathedral repertoire and beyond, the continuing commitment of Cathedrals to children in their choirs is particularly welcome. The inclusion of girls as well as boys has widened opportunity of the experience, and demonstrated that both can rise to the challenge, whether as separate groups or as a single body.

That opportunity is far from equal: it is still limited by gender, means and parental aspiration. Although the unequal opportunities and rewards offered to girls are an important concern, means and parental aspiration may prove more serious in the long term. There is a real danger that choristers will be drawn predominantly from a specialist group of affluent, often professional, middle-class families. How can this unique experience be offered more widely?

6. Long-term vision and continuity

It is easy to eschew the long term in favour of short-term issues facing Cathedral music. But the writing may be on the wall. We already know that the Church of England's overall financial position will become more vulnerable over the coming decades; that there is a shortage of children and of adult singers; that many gifted Christian musicians are choosing not to seek employment in Cathedrals; that a secularized society less interested in 'art music' (including Christians) undervalues the Cathedral tradition. These may prove to be more deep-rooted threats than ever before.

At several points in the past (the Reformation, the Commonwealth, and at various low points in the histories of individual Cathedrals), the continuity of English Cathedral music has been under severe threat. There has been a real prospect that there would be no musical sound of voices to sing praise to God, to complement the architecture, the sculpture, the glass – indeed there was none for over fifteen years in the seventeenth century. The English Cathedrals have

always bounced back – unlike many of those in Continental Europe – most notably at the Restoration, and have ensured the continuity of their musical tradition. In the last fifty years, with great changes in both Church and society, the Cathedrals have responded with new pastoral awareness in their liturgy and with an enhanced role for many of the choirs. Such a positive response has to be turned to the challenges of the future, taking an approach that is collective and bold, challenging and visionary, planned as part of a long-term and ongoing strategy, to sustain and develop the living tradition of music in English Cathedrals.

V: Recommendations

The recommendations presented here fall under four main headings, which in themselves identify four principal categories for further action:

- A. Affirmation of Cathedral music, and engagement in medium and long-term review and planning
- B. Collective action by the English Cathedrals working together
- C. Establishment of good working practices and relationships
- D. Effective management and operation of Cathedral music

These encapsulate in general terms over 300 detailed observations and recommendations made in the main text of the Report. (These key observations and recommendations will be available separately on request. They will also inform the compilation of the good practice guidelines listed in Appendix 8.)

Information and suggestions regarding good practice in relation to selected specific issues are to be found in Appendices 2 to 7.

In summary, the continuing health and development of Cathedral music are dependent on

- a life of corporate prayer and spiritual growth
sustained within a supportive Christian community
- high liturgical and musical standards
- continuing challenge, creativity and stimulation
- clear structures and guidelines, processes of decision-making
and boundaries of responsibility
- good inter-professional relations
- inter-departmental understanding and collaboration
- open and effective communication
- good working practices
- staff development and skills training
- realistic remuneration, resources, facilities and working budget
- realistic timetables and demands
- balance between Cathedral demands and other work (adults)
or education (students and children)
- effective and ongoing publicity and public relations
- effective recruitment

General Recommendations

The Report Group encourages the English Cathedrals to consider its recommendations:

A. Commitment to Cathedral music and its future

1. To affirm the special and unique contribution of English Cathedral music to the life of the Church; to emphasize its current vitality and high standards; and to recognize the challenges it faces in future decades in order to survive and develop.
2. To encourage each Cathedral to devise or adopt a model of practice that can both satisfy its particular musical requirements and be sustainable in financial terms, having in mind the other demands for ministry and mission, and its total resources.
3. To ensure that Cathedral music is a worthy part of all the worship of God offered in the Cathedral on behalf of the Diocese and the greater Church, representing the best and most creative praxis that is possible in each Cathedral.
4. To encourage all senior Cathedral staff to consider carefully and creatively the nature and role of music and of skilled musicians within the context of the shared ministry and mission of their particular Cathedral.
5. To encourage Cathedrals to be open to fresh ideas about ways of providing the most appropriate and best music in worship (no one model is right).
6. To seek to develop resources for boy and girl chorister training and for employed adult musicians to secure the future of Cathedral music, and to enable wide access.

B. Collective action by the English Cathedrals working together

7. To undertake collectively a national programme of promotion of Cathedral music.
8. To undertake collectively the national promotion of opportunities and benefits for children of singing in Cathedral choirs.
9. To develop and implement a national and co-ordinated strategy for the recruitment of musicians, children and adult singers to Cathedrals.
10. To consider collectively how to provide centrally for sharing of good practice, provision of training, and opportunities for career development.
11. To undertake a comprehensive and systematic review of the provision, costs and funding of music in the English Cathedrals.
12. To review collectively the future development and resourcing of music in English Cathedrals in a context which looks to the future with imagination and creativity.

C. Establishment of good working practices and relationships

13. To recognize the need throughout the Cathedral for clarity in decision-making processes, built on wide consultation, proper negotiation and a clear definition of the bounds of responsibility.
14. To ensure good relationships and effective communication between all engaged in the life of the Cathedral.
15. To ensure that all employees have contracts and job descriptions which clearly specify duties, responsibilities, expectations, terms and conditions, benefits and rights; and that

those working sessionally or as committed volunteers have comparable letters of engagement.

16. To establish good working practices, together with regular opportunities for negotiated review and appraisal.
17. To examine the Cathedral's music from both administrative and musical points of view; and to make recommendations for good practice in terms of management, structure, teamwork and accountability, with the central aim of delivering the music in the most effective and inspired manner.

D. Effective management and operation of Cathedral music

18. To ensure that there is a policy on music in the Cathedral which is widely negotiated, affirmed, and communicated throughout the Cathedral and all its departments.
19. To ensure that the needs of music and liturgy are adequately represented in the Chapter, preferably through a Canon Precentor and appropriate rights of access for the Director of Music.
20. To recognize that the Director of Music is responsible to the Chapter for the implementation of policy, and that it is important for the Director of Music to be involved and consulted about liturgy and matters affecting the Music Department
21. To review the pattern of sung services on a periodic basis in order to bring about a closer correspondence between the sung provision and the actual and perceived needs of the Cathedral's worship; to ensure that the most creative and/or efficient use is being made of the human resources within the Music Department; to check the workloads of child and adult singers and those who train them.

The Director of Music

22. To prepare a clear job description for the Director of Music (and thereafter, for other members of the music team), set in the context of the liturgy team, and to undertake review regularly, making adaptations in the light of changing circumstances.
23. To select a Director of Music primarily on his or her musical gifts, but also with regard to his or her capacity to work with and in a team, and openness to training in appropriate management and administration skills.
24. To offer the Director of Music appropriate training in administration, management, communications, choral direction, and vocal pedagogy.
25. To agree terms and conditions for additional work within the Cathedral, and for work undertaken outside the Cathedral.

Other music staff, adult singers, support and resources

26. To review the conditions, demands, expectations, training and remuneration of Assistant Directors of Music, Organ Scholars, Lay Clerks and Choral Scholars, and to consider better means of recruitment and retention.
27. To ensure that there is proper support for the Music Department, particularly with regard to administration and financial management, and that resources – including provision of music scores and maintenance of the organ(s) – are adequate.

Children

28. To evaluate the important role of children in Cathedral music and to review the wide range of related issues including education, pastoral support, family implications, and recruitment.
29. To ensure that an individual or group is charged with ongoing overview of the life, work and care of choristers. Where school and Cathedral are linked, there should be established processes for regular liaison between Cathedral and school; and where there is no link, there should be a forum in which parents can discuss these matters with the Director of Music and a designated member of the Chapter.
30. To ensure that due processes and provision are in place for the musical, vocal, personal and spiritual development, and for the pastoral care and supervision of children – bearing in mind the appropriate legislation; and to ensure that such processes and provision are reviewed at least annually.
31. To undertake regular review of the overall demands on individual children.

Appendices

Appendix 1:

Provision for music in English Cathedrals

The tables following this text include information on the current provision for music in the English Cathedrals. The information is presented in such a way that individual Cathedrals cannot be identified, but it is sufficiently detailed to provide a more practical financial context in which the general points made in the Report can be considered.

Thirty-eight of the 42 English Cathedrals responded to the Association of English Cathedrals in a survey of the provision for music conducted in 1999. The information from the returns has not been subject to detailed checking or sophisticated analysis. The present figures, even prior to such scrutiny, are valuable indicators.

1. The Cathedral's Music Department

Based on the returns from the 38 Cathedrals, the average size of the Music Department is 46 (adults and children). Of these, on average, 32 are children (both boys and girls), 11 are adult male singers (including an average of two Choral Scholars), and there are 3 music staff (most often full-time Director of Music, part-time Assistant, and an Organ Scholar). The smallest department numbers 27 (18 boys, 6 men, 3 music staff); in 7 of 38 Cathedrals there are over 60 in the department.

In all, the music of these 38 Cathedrals is provided by 1,747 singers, Directors of Music and their Assistants. Of these 1,234 are children (758 boys, 435 girls and 41 in mixed groups of boys and girls), 405 are adult singers (333 Lay Clerks and 72 Choral Scholars), and 108 are music staff.

A number of Cathedrals maintain a voluntary or special or parish choir of adults, or in a few cases a student choir who either sing certain services each week and/or during vacations. Information about these choirs was not included in the survey, and is therefore absent here.

2. Overall expenditure on music

The total actual expenditure (excluding housing) for the 38 Cathedrals amounted to over £5.5 million in 1999. Taking into account the other 4 Cathedrals, and other actual or hidden costs, the total in that year was about £7 million.

The financial support and investment for these choirs varies almost twenty-fold across the 38 Cathedrals, the pattern of funding reflecting in general the nature of the Cathedral's foundation. All but 2 of the 19 Cathedrals established before 1550 spend more than £100,000 on music. All but 4 of 19 Cathedrals established since 1800 spend less than £100,000, and (in the main) least is spent in those Cathedrals set up on a parish model (i.e. originally with a Provost) rather than as a capitular institution.

Average expenditure overall is £136,000 per annum. All these figures exclude provision of housing (for which those Cathedrals providing accommodation account in different ways). There are also some anomalies where the charges for choristers are met in other ways (e.g. an independent music trust). On this basis the realistic average is likely to be in excess of £150,000.

3. Distribution of funding

The distribution of funding varies: the music staff form the largest element of the expenditure in Cathedrals spending less than £100,000 per annum on their music. In the Cathedrals spending more than £100,000, the children account for the largest extent of the expenditure. One notable feature is the consistently modest expenditure on administrative support for such a large and complex department of the Cathedral. Even allowing for support from other departments this seems to represent a remarkably low level of provision, particularly given the expansion in more than half of the Cathedrals as a result of the introduction of girls' choirs, the expectation of greater managerial and financial responsibilities, and the increase in concerts, tours and recordings.

7. Music staff

In the majority of Cathedrals only the Director of Music (or equivalent) is engaged on a full-time basis; at two Cathedrals the Director of Music is part-time. Their Assistants are mostly part-time: at the 38 Cathedrals which sent in a return, only 16 Assistants out of 41 are deemed to be full-time, including three whose 'full-time' salary was reported as less than £10,000. There are also 29 Organ Scholars. The expansion of personnel in the choirs has been accompanied by considerable increase in expectation in terms of training, care and supervision, parental and school liaison, recruitment and general administration, but this has not in the main been reflected in staffing.

4. Adult singers

The income of Lay Clerks employed on a part-time basis averages at £4,000 per annum (in some 10 Cathedrals enhanced by assistance with housing). Only one Cathedral reported paying more than £10,000 per annum. Cathedrals may wish to reflect whether they are likely to recruit able singers to fulfil significant weekend and early evening commitments for the majority of the year at this level of remuneration. A separate column shows the provision in those Cathedrals where the Lay Clerks are either actually or effectively volunteers receiving a contribution to expenses.

5. Children

Children now represent 60%-75% of the personnel in a Cathedral Music Department. In only ten years girls have come to number more than a third of the children singing in Cathedrals. This effectively represents an expansion of 50% in the number of children overseen and trained by music staff during the decade. It is not always clear (either from the returns or from Cathedral, choir school and CSA websites) just what is the provision for singing children. On the evidence available, only 16 of the 42 Cathedrals offer boarding facilities for boy choristers, though at a further 9 all the boys attend a single day school. However, at the remaining 15 Cathedrals the boys come from different schools. In only 6 of 22 Cathedrals with girls' choirs do all the girls attend a single school, 5 of which offer boarding: in the other 16 Cathedrals they come from different schools. Of the mixed children's choirs, one attends a single school with boarding available, the other is drawn from different schools. (This represents the situation at 2001.)

Distribution of resources and funding in relation to Cathedral Music

Much of this information is derived from returns from members of the Association of English Cathedrals in a questionnaire completed in relation to the year 1999. This was returned by 38 of the 42 Cathedrals.

Annual spending on music (based on all 42 Cathedrals)

Less than £50K	4 Cathedrals	All former 'parish' cathedrals
£50K to £99K	14 Cathedrals	2 pre-1550, 3 post-1800 capitular, 9 'parish'
£100K to £149K	10 Cathedrals	7 pre-1550, 3 post-1800 capitular
£150K to £199K	8 Cathedrals	7 pre-1550, 1 post-1800 capitular
over £200K	6 Cathedrals	All pre-conquest

Distribution of spending (information from 38 Cathedrals)

Overall spending	below £50K	£50-99K	£100-149K	£150-199K	over £200K	Overall average	Overall nos. of people
Adult singers	14%	26%	21%	19%	30%	25%	405
Children	1%	11%	38%	51%	40%	35%	1,234
Music staff	62%	46%	26%	18%	17%	26%	108
Administration	2%	5%	5%	4%	6%	5%	?
Other costs	20%	15%	10%	12%	8%	9%	

Music Staff

Director of Music

Full-time	40
Part-time	2

First Assistant (information from 38 Cathedrals)

Full-time	14
Part-time	24

Second Assistant (4 Cathedrals)

Full-time	2
Part-time	2

Organ Scholar (information from 38 Cathedrals)

29

Spending on Music Staff in 1999 (information from 38 Cathedrals)

			Housing provided for					No one
			DM/A/OS	DM/A	DM/OS	DM	A/OS	
Over £60K	1 Cathedral			1				
£51-60K	2 Cathedrals	2 with girls	1	1				
£41-50K	3 Cathedrals	2 with girls	1			1		1
£31-40K	20 Cathedrals	9 with girls	6	6	3	3		2
£21-30K	11 Cathedrals	6 with girls	2	3		1		5
£1-20K	1 Cathedral	special circumstances					1	
Housing for	Director	29	of 38 Cathedrals					
	Assistant	22	of 38 Cathedrals					
	Organ Scholar	14	of 29 Cathedrals					
	No one	8	of 38 Cathedrals					

Spending on all adult singers in 1999 (information from 38 Cathedrals)

		Housing provided	
		Clerks	Scholars
Over £70K	3 Cathedral		
£51-70K	0 Cathedral		
£41-50K	3 Cathedrals	2	1
£31-40K	8 Cathedrals	5	2
£21-30K	8 Cathedrals	2	3
£11-20K	8 Cathedrals	1	
£1-10K	6 Cathedrals		
£0	2 Cathedrals		

Numbers of Lay Clerks in each Cathedral (information from 38 Cathedrals)

Remuneration	Over £2K	Less than 2K
Maximum	18	15
Minimum	3	6
Average	8	11

Lay Clerk remuneration in 1999 (information from 38 Cathedrals)

Over £10K	1 Cathedral	
£6-9.9K	3 Cathedrals	1 with housing
£4-5.9K	6 Cathedrals	4 with housing
£2-3.9K	17 Cathedrals	5 with housing
Less than 2K	8 Cathedrals	
£0	2 Cathedrals	
No clerks	1 Cathedral	

Numbers of choral scholars in each Cathedral (information from 38 Cathedrals)

Maximum	10
Minimum	1
Average	4 in 17 Cathedrals
No choral scholars	21 Cathedrals
Average stipend	£1.2K
Housing provided	6 Cathedrals

Children (information from 38 Cathedrals)

Boys' choir (36 choirs)

Maximum	40
Minimum	16
Average	20

Girls' choir (19 choirs)

Maximum	47
Minimum	16
Average	23

Boys and Girls in one choir (2 choirs)

Maximum	26
Minimum	15
Average	21

Spending on children in 1999 (information from 38 Cathedrals)

Over 100K	7 Cathedrals	3 with girls
£81-100K	4 Cathedrals	1 with girls
£61-80K	3 Cathedrals	1 with girls
£41-60K	3 Cathedrals	1 with girls
£21-40K	4 Cathedrals	3 with girls
£1-20K	10 Cathedrals	7 with girls
£0	7 Cathedrals	3 with girls

(including one Cathedral where funds come from separate trust)

Provision for chorister schools (64 groups of children in 42 Cathedrals)

	Day	Boarding	More than one school
Boys	9	16	15
Girls	1	5	16
Boys and girls		1	1

(Boarding may be offered but not always required.)

Other expenditure in 1999 (information from 38 cathedrals)

Administration

Over £40K	1 Cathedral
£21-40K	0
£11-20K	6 Cathedrals
£1-10K	26 Cathedrals
£0	5 Cathedrals

Other costs (including instrument maintenance, robes and music)

Over £40K	1 Cathedral
£21-40K	4 Cathedrals
£11-20K	9 Cathedrals
£1-10K	24 Cathedrals

Appendix 2: The Cathedral Director of Music

Framework and checklist for drafting a job description, and terms and conditions of employment

Some of these issues might be subsumed in an institutional handbook.

Much of the detail in section B4 would be subject to annual review and amendment during an annual appraisal.

A. Outline of the Cathedral and the Music (or Liturgy) Department

1. The Cathedral

- Principal functions
- Resources (especially human)
- Organizational structure
- Management and governance
- Procedures for decision-making
- Accountability

2. The Music Department (or Liturgy) Department

- Principal functions
- Resources (especially human)
- Structure
- Management and governance
- Procedures for decision-making
- Accountability

B. The Director of Music's post, responsibilities and working practices

1. Outline of the post

- Principal responsibilities
- Duties (in and out of term)
- Required skills and qualities (and their ongoing development)
- Reporting

2. Detailed responsibilities and working practices in the Cathedral with regard to

2.1. *Activities*

Liturgy
Choral services
Other functions, events and activities (of choir and/or director)

- in the Cathedral
- in the diocese
- in the wider community
- in relation to customarily associated choirs, festivals etc.

Commercial enterprises (including broadcasts, concerts, recordings, tours)
Public relations, marketing, fund-raising

2.2. *Working Relationships*

Chapter
Precentor
Assistant Director(s) of Music
Adult singers
Student organists and singers
Children
Children's parents
Additional voluntary singers (or choir)
Headteacher(s) and other relevant staff of associated school(s),
as appropriate
Other departments of the Cathedral
Other organizations using the Cathedral
The diocese
The wider community

2.3. *Resources*

Budget
Management of financial resources
Management of physical resources (e.g. instruments, music)

C. Good Practice

1. Guidelines and legal awareness

Communication and human relations
Management and financial procedures
Health and safety
Child protection
Equal opportunities

D. Terms and conditions

1. Employment

Extent of employment (full- or part-time)
Salary

Pension
Allowances
Expenses
Housing
Working hours (and any waivers), both in term and out of term
Holidays
Appraisal and review of post
Provision for ongoing training and development
Disciplinary and grievance procedure

2. Arrangements for work (and payment where appropriate) undertaken by the Director of Music in addition to normal Cathedral duties

Special Cathedral events and special services
Recitals
Conducting
Tours
Examining
Composing and arranging (including royalties and rights)
Distinction of in-term and out-of-term arrangements

3. Arrangements for independent work (whether paid or voluntary) undertaken by the Director of Music on his/her own initiative outside the Cathedral

Recitals
Conducting
Tours
Examining
Composing and arranging (including royalties and rights)
Distinction of in-term and out-of-term arrangements

4. Screening for suitability to work with children

Appendix 3: A note on appraisal

Appraisal can be an affirming and helpful part of the process of ongoing personal review and development. It can provide a framework within which needs, concerns and problems can be raised in a controlled situation, and an individual's achievements and contribution can be formally valued and recognized.

Appraisal is best conducted annually, and can be part of a wider annual review of both the institution and the department in question. In a Cathedral situation it is helpful for the initiative for appraisal to rest with the appraisee, rather than with the appraiser. A number of universities have followed this approach, and found it more appropriate than a more assertive practice typical of industry and commerce, where the appraiser sets the agenda and evaluates performance against a set benchmark.

The basis for an appraisal discussion might well be a short report prepared by the appraisee and sent to the appraiser(s) in advance. About a month before the appraisal discussion, the appraisee should be asked to reflect on the past year, and to prepare this short report. Both reflection and report should take as their starting point the agreed job description on which the contract of employment is based, and any agreed note of appraisal from a previous year. The report should consider each aspect of the post, and observe achievements, constraints and plans for the future. It should note issues that require attention, and state whether these can be addressed by the appraisee, whether assistance, training or development is required, or whether it lies outside the remit of the appraisee to take action. This report should form the basis of the appraisal discussion.

Three models for appraisers may be considered: two appraisers from within the Cathedral, one from within the Cathedral and one external appraiser, or one external appraiser. In the case of the Director of Music, the two 'internal' appraisers may most likely be the Canon Precentor (or member of Chapter responsible for music) and the Cathedral Administrator. There is much to commend the use of an external appraiser, provided that he or she understands the nature of the Cathedral and its operation, as well as the appraisee's specific responsibilities.

At the end of the appraisal discussion there should be an opportunity to bring together points raised, and to identify a plan of action. Both the points raised and the plan of action should be recorded in a formal note of the appraisal discussion, which should be drafted by an appraiser. The draft text of this note should be agreed between all who took part in the appraisal meeting, and signed by each of them. Copies of the signed report should be lodged in the appraisee's confidential file in the Cathedral office, and with the appraisee.

There may be occasions when relations with the line manager are difficult, or where the line manager is seen as a cause of constraints. Where possible it is good for these matters to be discussed sensitively but openly. However, there may be instances where the appraisee has to raise the issues outside the appraisal discussion with another senior officer.

Appendix 4: Care and supervision of children

1. Sources of guidance

There are five appropriate sources of guidance on care and supervision of children:

- The Children Act
- The Bishops' Guidelines
- The Diocesan Guidelines
- The Local Social Services
- The Incorporated Society of Musicians (especially on one-to-one teaching situations).

Schools and organizations dealing with children also have their own codes.

Consultation and advice can be obtained from

- The Cathedral Child Protection Officer
- The Diocesan Child Protection Officer
- The Local Social Services Child Protection Officer
- The Choir School or one of the schools from which choristers are drawn.

Codes of practice should be drawn up that address not only Child Protection but also Health and Safety.

2. Towards a code of practice

This Appendix does not provide a comprehensive code, but does raise some issues that are specific to Cathedrals and choristers, including all children under the age of 18.

The arrangements put in place in each Cathedral must include provision for care and supervision for these occasions:

- Arrival (and transit between school and Cathedral)
- When rehearsing
- When not rehearsing
- When dressing, visiting the lavatories etc.
- Departure
- When undertaking a special event at Cathedral (e.g. concert, recording)
- When undertaking a special event at another venue
- When on tour.

3. Rehearsal

It is common practice for choristers to rehearse under the direction of one adult. This is comparable with the norm in the school classroom. There may be no difficulty in this arrangement, provided that another adult is available to assist without delay in case of emergency.

It is good practice to keep a record with time and date of any incidents that occur during rehearsal. Such an incident might include children's sickness, emotional upset, and occasions when the adult in charge has recognized an error of judgement.

Common sense may not always be sufficient. Particular care needs to be exercised in medical emergency. Treatment should not normally be administered, except where you have express permission, appropriate training and knowledge of the individual child. First Aid training should be provided to a sufficient number of adults to provide necessary cover, and appropriate permissions and knowledge should be acquired for every child.

Where there is no other adult readily at hand in the immediate vicinity of rehearsal, it may be necessary to make special arrangements. It may be worth considering the productive use of a second member of the music staff to act as rehearsal accompanist, offering training by example in choir training and resolving performance issues before rehearsal in the Cathedral. In other cases, a pastoral assistant may be required.

4. One-to-one tuition

One-to-one tuition is one of the most effective means of teaching musical skills, including individual voice training. This is also the situation in which there is most likely to be risk to both child and adult.

Once again there must be another adult immediately accessible to assist in an emergency, and it is good practice to keep a written record with time and date of any incident. It is helpful for tuition rooms to have a glass panel so that they can be observed readily from the corridor.

Organ tuition, and the custom of choristers turning pages or collecting music from the organ loft need special consideration, since a single child and an adult may be alone together in an isolated part of the Cathedral.

In every case the situation needs to be assessed, including the risk to the child and the risk to the adult. Particularly helpful advice is issued to members of the ISM for the benefit of music teachers.

5. Vestry provision

There should preferably be separate robing rooms, and separate lavatory and washing provision for adults and children (just as these are separated for staff and pupils in a school).

6. Outside rehearsal

Choristers are more likely to have wider occasional contact with other Cathedral staff and with the public. The risks need to be assessed, procedures established, and regular review conducted.

It is essential that any Cathedral staff and any volunteers who may have regular if occasional contact with choristers are checked according to the Cathedral's Child Protection procedures. All adults in the Cathedral should be briefed to be vigilant at all times with regard to the children's care and safety, and suitable arrangements should be put in place.

The physical risks of the Cathedral and choir areas should also be assessed. Worn steps, poor lighting, and other features and encumbrances of old and listed buildings need attention. The children themselves need to be briefed and reminded about any risks in and around the building. Candles and robes present their own hazards, singly and in combination, and

precautions and briefing need to be in place. Particular care needs to be taken where there are temporary platforms for concerts, or cables for recording.

Appendix 5: Children, government and the law

Children are affected by European Community, National and Local Government directives, legislation, and by-laws.

1. Health and safety

Children are regarded as employees in some legislation (e.g. Health and Safety), just as they are as pupils at school. The conditions of work, risk assessment, and specific conditions for children and young persons which apply to schools will be relevant in Cathedrals (*The Management of Health and Safety at Work Regulations*, 1999).

2. Employment and performance

The activities of a chorister touch on several areas where national legislation on children is strict, including children in employment and children in performance. The Department of Health has published helpful summaries of the current legislation relating to both. These are available on the Department of Health website (www.doh.gov.uk, last reviewed January 1997). Some controls in both areas rest with Local Authorities, and this may affect local provision and requirements.

Two particular matters leave room for interpretation. First, the interpretation of 'employment'. One Local Authority leaflet states that 'you are employed if you assist in any trade or occupation carried on for profit whether or not you are paid or otherwise rewarded' (Milton Keynes, 1999). Second, the Department of Health summary points out that "Performance" is not strictly defined and discretion is left to the licensing authority. Guidance suggests that any activity in which a child is directed should be regarded as a performance.'

In the context of Cathedral music, all broadcasts, concerts where a charge is made for admission, services or other events where fees are due, filming and recordings will need to be considered carefully. All may fall within the definition of 'employment', which is not allowed for children under the age of 13. Broadcasts, concerts and recordings will fall within the definition of 'performance'. Where Lay Clerks, who form part of the choir under the same direction as the children, are paid for the work they undertake, this may blur the employment situation.

With regard to performance, the Department of Health summary advises: 'The general rule is that no child may take part in a performance unless licensed to do so by the Local Authority in whose area he lives. Exceptions are that (a) a child may perform up to four days in any period of six months without a licence; and (b) performances arranged by schools and by certain other bodies approved as such by the Secretary of State or by Local Authorities are exempt from the licensing requirement (so long as the child is not paid).'

There are detailed requirements over working hours, education, supervision and care, and facilities with regard to different kinds of performance (distinguishing broadcasts and films from other kinds of performance). The Local Authority will need to be consulted with regard to licensing arrangements. Detailed requirements and conditions will also be set by the Local Authority. Even where a Cathedral Music Department does not exceed four performances in six months, it may be prudent to liaise with the Local Authority as a matter of good practice.

3. An out-of-school hours learning programme

The Department for Education and Employment commends Out of School Hours Learning, and the document on this topic contains useful reflections on the scope, objectives, monitoring and review of learning activities, which include minority subjects and creative arts. This can be found on the DfEE website (www.dfes.gov.uk, reviewed October 2000). The rehearsal and singing of services undertaken by choristers may be regarded as part of a programme of Out of School Learning, encouraged by the DfEE, and in harmony with the department's support for gifted children. Nevertheless, due consideration must be given to the commitment required of the children in the Cathedral, and of the total demands on each individual child.

4. Working directives

Many of the international directives on children in employment are intended to prevent exploitation of child labour. Nevertheless, in assessing the overall demands on their choristers, Cathedrals should have regard to these legal instruments as a matter of good practice.

The United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child (1990), now ratified in 185 States worldwide, includes the following points in Article 32 (Rights of Child Workers):

- A child's work is hazardous when: it is harmful to their health and development; *it causes too much physical or emotional stress*; it leaves them no time to go to school, or *makes them too tired to learn*; it leaves them no time to rest or play.
- A child's work is exploitative when: it forces them to work full-time at too early an age; *it gives them too much responsibility*; it does not pay them fairly for the work they do; it takes away their dignity and self esteem.

Cathedrals may need to have regard to the clauses in italic in assessing the specific and overall demands on each chorister.

Attention should also be given to a European Directive on the Protection of Young People at Work, required in all member States from 1996, and specifically to national legislation covered in the UK (this broadly coincides with the Directive). Some Local Authorities have incorporated the additional requirements of the Directive in their own provision. A model set out by one Local Authority (Milton Keynes, 1999) is as follows:

Hours of Work

A child may not work before 7.00 am or after 7.00 pm on any day.

A child may not work for more than two hours on any school day (with not more than one hour before school).

Ages 13 & 14

School Days and Sunday: maximum two hours.

Term Time: maximum 17 hours per week.

Saturdays and School Holidays: maximum five hours on any day.

Maximum 25 hours per week when not required to attend school.

Ages 15 & 16

School Days and Sunday: maximum two hours.

Term Time: maximum 20 hours per week.

Saturdays and School Holidays: maximum eight hours on any day.

Maximum 35 hours per week when not required to attend school.

Rest Breaks

There must be a break of at least one hour after four hours' work.

School Holiday Employment

In a year there must be at least two consecutive weeks free from employment.

5. The chorister's commitment to Cathedral duties

Although it may be argued that Cathedral rehearsals and services are not employment, they are undertaken in a working environment under direction. Cathedrals may be wise to take account of the requirements of the Directive as a model of good practice, and to take note that there may need to be a further downward adjustment for children under the age of 13.

- The commitment of a chorister to Cathedral duties (rehearsal and services) might be based on the benchmark for working children, which sets a limit of 17 hours in a week for those aged 13 and 14. It may be prudent to consider a lower commitment for those aged 12 and under.
- Due consideration should also be given to the commitment on any one day (bearing in mind the two-hour limit on working), and to free time and holidays.
- Cathedrals may do well to discuss their arrangements, if only informally, with the Local Authority, and to seek guidance from the Authority on best practice.

6. The Department for Education and Employment: other models of good practice

The Department for Education and Employment offers other documents relating to Supervision of Children, Pupil Supervision Out of School, and School Visits. Although directed primarily to schools, these documents provide models of good practice and advice. They can also be found on the DfEE website (www.dfes.gov.uk, reviewed December 2000-February 2001). The advisory document on School Visits is useful in raising issues of supervision, and makes very detailed recommendations which will be especially helpful for tours (in the UK and abroad) but also as a checklist for day-to-day care and supervision.

7. Choristers singing abroad

Distinction should be made between foreign tours which are equivalent to school visits (i.e. where the funds are raised in the UK, and where no payment for any singing abroad is made either to anyone involved or to the Cathedral), and those in which payment is received for

performing (bearing in mind the broad definition of ‘performance’ cited above in section 2). Special conditions pertain to children performing abroad, and a licence must be obtained from a magistrate. In England and Wales this process is handled by the Magistrates’ Court in Bow St, London. An application requires substantial documentation, and the process needs to be undertaken well in advance.

The conditions of the licence are rigorous with regard to supervision, hours of work and rest, and return to the UK. It is important to be clear of these requirements before planning the programme of the tour in order to ensure that these can be met.

Appendix 6:

Housing for Cathedral musicians and singers – a note on taxation liability and pension contributions

The provision of housing, either without rent or with significantly reduced rent, is regarded as a benefit of employment, and is liable to tax.

Certain occupations which require attendance on a 24-hour basis (including house masters, house mistresses and house tutors in boarding schools) qualify for exemption, and there is special provision for the clergy.

Cathedral musicians and singers are not included in the list of occupations that demand availability for 24-hour attendance, and therefore do not necessarily qualify for exemption. Approaches to the Chancellor of the Exchequer have not persuaded him to change this arrangement.

Where the Cathedral musicians serve a Cathedral with a boarding choir school, the Chancellor has indicated that there may be some justification for exemption from taxation because of the greater duties of supervision. In all cases it cannot be assumed.

Housing or other benefits in kind are part of the income of the employee. They will therefore have an impact on pension contributions.

In calculating pension contributions for salaried Cathedral musicians and singers (whether full or part-time), the gross value of the benefit of any housing provided, and any other benefits in kind, should be taken into account as part of the total income of the employee.

The value of these benefits will be entered annually on form P11D, copies of which are sent by the employer to the Inland Revenue and given to the employee.

Where the housing or other benefit is deemed to be essential to the execution of duties (and therefore exempt from tax) there is obviously no benefit to be taken into account in calculating pension contributions.

Appendix 7: Employment, fees and pensions

The matter of employment needs careful attention, especially with regard to Cathedral Lay Clerks and Organ or Choral Scholars. In Cathedrals with salaried Lay Clerks they are normally treated as part-time employees. In one Cathedral, the Revenue has agreed (for the time being) that the casual nature of services rendered by a pool of singers from whom the lower voices of the choir are drawn on an occasional basis allows them to be treated as self-employed. The middle ground, where an ‘honorarium’ or ‘stipend’ is paid (i.e. a payment to recognize the service provided by a Lay Clerk, but not regarded on either side as a realistic payment), is no longer available. Such service is likely to be classified as remuneration for employed work, and to contravene the National Minimum Wage legislation.

Where Organ or Choral Scholars undertake duties as part of their full-time higher or further education, any payments made to them are still liable to tax and National Insurance, but the requirements for minimum wage and pension are not normally applicable. Where there is no involvement in an approved programme of higher or further education (e.g. ‘gap year’), these ‘scholars’ are likely to be regarded as part-time employees, with all the rights and benefits that accrue to them, including minimum wage and pension if they are aged 18 or over.

When fees are paid to the Cathedral choir for broadcasts, recordings and other occasional events, the Revenue has taken the view that these payments normally extend from the employed service of the individual members of the Cathedral choir as part-time employees. Such payments are therefore to be treated as part of the employed income, with the normal deduction of tax and National Insurance. They do not qualify as self-employed fees for services rendered.

The legislation on pensions requires that, from October 2001, most employers must provide access to a pension scheme for all employees (full- and part-time); there are certain exemptions. Where there is no occupational or personal pension scheme available to an employee, the Cathedral will need to provide employees with access to a stakeholder pension. Employers are not required to contribute to the stakeholder pension scheme, and employees are not required to take up the pension arrangements offered. Explanatory leaflets are available from the government, and can be read on and downloaded from the internet (www.dss.gov.uk/publications/dss/2000/stakeholder_emp/ and also www.pensions.gov.uk). Where there is a contributory pension scheme, this should be based on the total value of all regular income and benefits liable to tax. This includes the value of housing (valued at the taxable sum), but excludes occasional additional payments (e.g. fees for broadcasts or special services).

Appendix 8: Models of good practice – a preliminary list

Throughout the Report and the Appendices there have been indications of good practice. It has exceeded the time limit and capacity of the Reporting Group to undertake comprehensive compilation of good practice. What follows is a checklist which may be taken forward by the Cathedral Music Working Party to produce a handbook.

1. The Cathedral Music Department

- Management and accountability
- Lines of communication
- Authority and discipline
- Head of Department
- Relationship with Precentor
- Relationship with Chapter
- Relationship with Chief Executive
- The Choir(s)
- Timetable and programme

- Arrangements for special events in the Cathedral (including broadcasts and recordings)
- Events and tours away from the Cathedral
- Agreements and contracts with external agencies

- The Director of Music
- The Assistant(s)
- The Organ Scholar(s)
- The Lay Clerks (employed)
- The Lay Clerks (voluntary)
- Choral Scholars
- The choristers
- The school(s)
- The choristers' parents

- Publicity and public relations

2. Individual members of the Music Department: employment, engagement and care

- Advertising

- Recruitment
- Appointment
- Duties and requirements
- Contract (for employees) or letter of agreement (for volunteers)
- Terms and conditions

- Attendance
- Induction
- Training
- Ongoing development
- Review and appraisal

- Remuneration and benefits in kind
- Housing
- Pension
- Sickness
- Absence and holidays
- Relation to other work

- Children in out-of-school-hours educational activities, and in working and performing situations

- Liaison
- Balance of work
- Pastoral care
- Care and supervision
- Spiritual welfare
- Health and safety
- Child protection
- Equal opportunities
- Human rights (including working-time directive)

3. Resources

- Organ
- Robes
- Music
- Facilities
- Choir stalls
- Lighting